



CITY OF LOS ANGELES

BOARD OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSIONERS

MINUTES

COMMISSIONERS

GUY LIPA

President

KARLA M. GOULD

Vice President

JEANNE A. FUGATE

MONIKA KIRENGA

NANCY P. MCCLELLAND

Commissioners

REGULAR MEETING – 10:00 A.M. THURSDAY, APRIL 10, 2025 IN-PERSON MEETING ROOM 350, PERSONNEL BUILDING 700 EAST TEMPLE STREET LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90012

In conformance with Government Code § 54950 (The Brown Act) this in-person meeting of the Board of Civil Service Commissioners will permit any person wishing to address the Commission in public comment an opportunity by visiting the posted meeting location of the Commission in-person or by dialing (669) 900-6833, to make a public comment virtually. Follow the prompts and enter the Meeting ID code **890 8807 6164** followed by the pound sign (#). When asked, enter the passcode **614180** and the pound sign (#) again to continue. Public Comment should be within the subject jurisdiction of the Board. Please dial *9 when the Commission reaches “Public Comment,” item three on this Minutes. The caller will be called upon and the phone or device unmuted. Speakers should state and spell their name for the record before beginning their one minute of public comment.

Digital audio recordings of Commission Board meetings are available for download on detachable storage device for 30 days after each meeting. Information on acquiring an audio copy of a meeting may be obtained by contacting the Commission Office at (213) 473-9107. Website: <http://www.lacity.org>

Attending the meeting:

Commission President Guy Lipa
Commission Vice President Karla M. Gould
Commissioner Jeanne Fugate
Commissioner Monika Kirenga
Commissioner Nancy P. McClelland

Deputy City Attorney Jorge Otano
Interim General Manager Grayce Liu
Commission Executive Director
Bruce E. Whidden

1. **CALL TO ORDER**

The meeting was called to order at 10:16 a.m.

2. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

- a. The Board unanimously approved the minutes of Thursday, March 13, 2025 on a motion by Commissioner Fugate, seconded by Commissioner Kirenga.
- b. The Board unanimously approved the minutes of Thursday, March 27, 2025 as corrected on a motion by Commissioner Fugate, seconded by Commissioner Kirenga.

3. **PUBLIC COMMENTS ON MATTERS WITHIN BOARD’S JURISDICTION**

Two persons spoke via Zoom, Names were not given

4. **COMMISSION ACTION ON ROUTINE AND OTHER MATTERS**

The Board unanimously approved routine and non-appearance matters under Unfinished Business page two, items 6 & 7 and New Business, pages five thru 10, items 9 and 10

5. **GENERAL MANAGER'S REPORT**

The Interim General Manager spoke of the serious financial crisis facing the City with upwards of 2,000 layoffs possible. The Personnel Department is facing the loss of nearly a dozen position authorities, which would have serious impact on the Department's ability to accomplish its corps functions. Citywide, all options are on the table. The Mayor and Counsel leadership have traveled to Sacramento to seek assistance from the state.

The New General Manager, Malaika Billups is expected to take up her new duties on April 21.

The IGM thanked the Board for their support over the last several months.

6. UNFINISHED CLASSIFICATION ACTIONS

The Interim General Manager recommends that, having given a 10-day notice of intention on March 27, 2025, the Board of Civil Service Commissioners now:

1. Create the new classification of **Instructional Designer**, Class Code 9604
and
2. Adopt the new class specifications for **Instructional Designer**, Class Code 9604.

File No. 56069

COMMISSION ACTION: RECOMMENDATION APPROVED**7. ADMINISTRATIVE CLOSURE**

Viktor GLUKHOVSKIY, Security Officer, Los Angeles Police Department.

On February 4, 2020, an Appeal from Discharge as a Security Officer with the Los Angeles Police Department was filed by letter from the Appellant to the Office of the Civil Service Commission. The appeal was late, beyond the Charter mandated five calendar days, because the prospective appellant was incarcerated without bond, awaiting trial on double-murder charges. Because the General Form 77 had not been sent to Personnel Records by the Los Angeles Police Department, the Commission retained jurisdiction to accept an Appeal.

The late appeal was granted and the process started. On the advice of the City Attorney, the case was held in abeyance pending the outcome of the criminal trial.

On January 17, 2025, news media reports reached the Commission with details of the Appellant's conviction and sentencing to life in prison without the possibility of parole. Under the circumstances the Civil Service Commission has no choice but to administratively close the appeal.

No record had yet been created in this case.

Staff recommends that the Appeal from Discharge of Viktor Glukhovskiy be administratively closed and the action made a matter of record.

Files 55432

COMMISSION ACTION: CLOSURE APPROVED, MADE A MATTER OF RECORD.

8. APPEAL UNDER CHARTER SECTION 1016

a. Raul GATEZ, Wastewater Collection Worker II, Department of Public Works, Bureau of Sanitation. Suspension effective December 18, 2022 to January 1, 2023.

Report and recommendations of the Board's Hearing Examiner Sheri Ross, following the holding of a hearing on August 27, 2024, into the appeal of Mr. Gatez.

Pursuant to Government Code 54957, the Civil Service Commission may elect to meet in closed session in order to confer with its legal counsel regarding a matter related to pending litigation or the discipline of an employee under Charter Section 1016. No binding votes will be taken.

The Hearing Examiner recommends that the Board:

A. FIND that the City's *Skelly* due process provisions were met.

B. Causes of Action:

1. NOT SUSTAIN the cause of action of demonstrating insensitivity to other by making derogatory comments, epithets, jokes, teasing remarks or slurs.
2. NOT SUSTAIN the cause of action performance below standards, failure to perform work assignments adequately or promptly on October 31, 2022.

C. FIND that the penalty of a 10-working day suspension was not appropriate and is NOT Sustained.

D. ADOPT the findings and conclusions in the Hearing Examiner's Report, as corrected during the discussion, as the Board's own.

File No. 55739

COMMISSION ACTION***Discussion:***

The Department expressed its disappointment with the conclusions reached by the hearing Examiner. The Department said it believed it made had made its case through testimony at the hearing. Commissioners McClelland and Fugate noted that while the Department is discussing the matter of the Appellant leaving the work location, no such charge is noted on the General Form 77, nor discussed in the *Skelly* Report. Contending that the charge is covered in count Two is a stretch, and while there was testimony that he left at 1p.m., the Department's own exhibit signed by its witness showed that the Appellant arrive by 6:35 a.m. and worked his full shift.

Commissioner McClelland commented on the Hearing Examiner's view that the use of the "F" word between co-workers seemed not to bother either party and the lead worker was not disciplined. Finally, the two participants in the dust-up seemed to resolve the situation between themselves at least before the end of the day.

The Appellant's Representative noted that the Hearing Examiner stated that she did not find the Department's principle witness [O'Keefe] to be credible and barely intelligible.

8. APPEAL UNDER CHARTER SECTION 1016, (Continued)

a. Raul GATEZ, Wastewater Collection Worker II, Department of Public Works, Bureau of Sanitation, (Continued).

Commission Action:

In a series of motions by Commissioner Fugate, seconded by Commissioner Kirenga, the Board voted unanimously to:

FIND that the City's *Skelly* due process provisions were met.

NOT SUSTAIN the cause of action of demonstrating insensitivity to other by making derogatory comments, epithets, jokes, teasing remarks or slurs.

NOT SUSTAIN the cause of action performance below standards, failure to perform work assignments adequately or promptly on October 31, 2022.

FIND that the penalty of a 10-working day suspension was NOT appropriate and is NOT Sustained.

ADOPT the findings and conclusions in the Hearing Examiner's Report, as corrected during the discussion, as the Board's own.

File No. 55739

Appearances

Dina Ramirez, Client Services Division I, Personnel Department for the Department of Public Works, Bureau of Sanitation.

Jeanie Molinar, Client Services Division I, Personnel Department for the Department of Public Works, Bureau of Sanitation.

Dana Fujimoto, Appellant's Representative

Raul Gatez, Appellant

8. APPEAL UNDER CHARTER SECTION 1016

- b. Jerome WEBB**, Custodian Supervisor, Department of Airports.
Discharge effective June 6, 2023.

Report and recommendations of the Board's Hearing Examiner Stephen Biersmith, following the holding of a hearing on April 24, 2024, into the appeal of Mr. Webb.

Pursuant to Government Code 54957, the Civil Service Commission may elect to meet in closed session in order to confer with its legal counsel regarding a matter related to pending litigation or the discipline of an employee under Charter Section 1016. No binding votes will be taken.

The Hearing Examiner recommends that the Board:

A. FIND that the City's *Skelly* due process provisions were met.

B. Causes of Action:

1. SUSTAIN the cause of action that on February 18, 2022 the Appellant violated several rules and regulations contained in the Department's Administrative Manual.
2. SUSTAIN the cause of action that on February 18, 2022 the Appellant violated Department's Administrative Manual Section 5.020 (B): Job Performance below standard, subsection (1) – A violation of Department rules.
 - a. SUSTAIN the cause of action that on February 18, 2022 the Appellant violated the Department's Administrative Manual Section 2.090: (Abusive Workplace Conduct Prevention).
 - b. SUSTAIN the cause of action that on February 18, 2022, the Appellant violated the Department's Administrative Manual Section 8.170: (Workplace Violence Prevention).
3. SUSTAIN the cause of action that on February 18, 2022, the Appellant violated Department's Administrative Manual Section 5.020 (D): Improper Behavior In relations with supervisors, fellow employees, or the public, and subsection (4): Make threats (verbal or non-verbal) or initiating a confrontation with the public, supervisors or co-workers; and Subsection (6): Actions on the job intended to destroy property or to inflict bodily injury (whether the destruction or injury actually occurs).

C. FIND that the penalty of discharge imposed was appropriate and should be Sustained.

D. ADOPT the findings and conclusions in the Hearing Examiner's report as the Board's own.
File No. 55870

COMMISSION ACTION:***Discussion:***

The Department expressed its support for the findings and recommendation made by the Hearing Examiner. The record shows that Webb was the clear aggressor in this case, noting that Webb had been disciplined for a similar offence in 2014. The Appellant offered no mitigation to his actions; the Department's zero tolerance policy for violence in the workplace made discharge the only possible penalty in this case.

Commissioner Gould asked if police report filed was part of the record. The Department answered that it was and the Appellant was arrested and charged with felony assault, later reduced to a misdemeanor on the condition that the Appellant complete anger management classes, which he did.

The Appellant's Representative noted that the incident was a conflict between two supervisors. Webb recognizes that he was wrong to act as he did, was remorseful and apologetic.

April 10, 2025 minutes

8. APPEAL UNDER CHARTER SECTION 1016, (Continued)**b. Jerome WEBB, Custodian Supervisor, Department of Airports, (Continued).*****Commission Action:***

In a series of motions by Commissioner Fugate, seconded by Commissioner McClelland, the Board voted unanimously to:

FIND that the City's *Skelly* due process provisions were met.

SUSTAIN the cause of action that on February 18, 2022 the Appellant violated several rules and regulations contained in the Department's Administrative Manual.

SUSTAIN the cause of action that on February 18, 2022 the Appellant violated Department's Administrative Manual Section 5.020 (B): Job Performance below standard, subsection (1) – A: violation of Department rules.

- a. SUSTAIN the cause of action that on February 18, 2022 the Appellant violated the Department's Administrative Manual Section 2.090: (Abusive Workplace Conduct Prevention).
- b. SUSTAIN the cause of action that on February 18, 2022, the Appellant violated the Department's Administrative Manual Section 8.170: (Workplace Violence Prevention).

SUSTAIN the cause of action that on February 18, 2022, the Appellant violated Department's Administrative Manual Section 5.020 (D): Improper Behavior in relations with supervisors, fellow employees, or the public, and subsection (4): Make threats (verbal or non-verbal) or initiating a confrontation with the public, supervisors or co-workers; and Subsection (6): Actions on the job intended to destroy property or to inflict bodily injury (whether the destruction or injury actually occurs).

FIND that the penalty of discharge imposed was appropriate and is Sustained.

ADOPT the findings and conclusions in the Hearing Examiner's report as the Board's own.

Appearances:

Mily Hintely, Deputy City Attorney, Legal Division, Department of Airports

Farah Vasquez, Human Resources Division, Department of Airports

Esteban Lizardo, Appellant's Representative

9. ADMINISTRATIVE ACTIONS

- a. The General Manager recommends that:

Pursuant to Civil Service Rule 4.2, the Board shall make the significant changes in the following bulletins promulgated on the date noted a matter of record:

March 21, 2025

Interdepartmental Promotional

ASSOCIATE ZONING ADMINISTRATOR
BUILDING MAINTENANCE DISTRICT SUPERVISOR
INSTRUMENT MECHANIC SUPERVISOR
PRINCIPAL STOREKEEPER
STEAM PLANT OPERATING SUPERVISOR

Interdepartmental Promotional and Open Competitive

BUILDING MECHANICAL INSPECTOR

March 28, 2025

Interdepartmental Promotional

PAINTER SUPERVISOR
PRINCIPAL CIVIL ENGINEERING DRAFTING TECHNICIAN
STEAM PLANT MAINTENANCE MECHANIC
UTILITY SERVICES MANAGER

Interdepartmental Promotional and Open Competitive

ELECTRIC METER SETTER
FIRE SPRINKLER INSPECTOR

Open Competitive

ELECTRICAL CRAFT HELPER
WASTEWATER TREATMENT OPERATOR

9. ADMINISTRATIVE ACTIONS

- b. Make a matter of record the Interim General Manager's action in approving the use of the following Special Examining Assistants:
1. **CHIEF CONSTRUCTION INSPECTOR**
Charles ADAMS, Harbor Engineer II, Harbor Department and Crystal LEE, Deputy General Manager, Department of Airports.
 2. **DEPARTMENTAL CHIEF ACCOUNTANT**
Ma Elizabe SALUMBIDES, Senior Management Analyst II, Department of General Services and Myo SASAKI, Assistant General Manager, Department of Fire and Police Pensions.
 3. **ELECTRICAL SERVICES MANAGER**
Theodore ZEISS, Electrical Services Manager III, and Ryan GRAY, Electrical Services Manager II, Department of Water & Power
 4. **HARBOR PUBLIC AND COMMUNITY RELATIONS DIRECTOR**
David LIBATIQUE, First Deputy General Manager and Phillip SANFIELD, Traffic Manager, Harbor Department.
 5. **PRINCIPAL CITY PLANNER**
Kevin KELLER and Haydee URITA-LOPEZ, Deputy Director of Planning, City Planning Department.
 6. **SENIOR ACCOUNTANT**
Ning CAO, Financial Management Specialist III, Office of the City Controller and Shu Hua (Sue) CHEN, Departmental Chief Accountant IV, Department of Transportation.
 7. **SENIOR HOUSING PLANNING AND ECONOMIC ANALYST**
Luz SANTIAGO, Assistant General Manager and Emilyzen CERVANTES, Chief Management Analyst, Housing Department.
 8. **TRAFFIC PAINTER AND SIGN POSTER**
Guillermo VILLALPANDO, Traffic Marking and Sign Superintendent II, Department of Transportation, Michael HENDRICKS, Airport Maintenance Supervisor III, Department of Airports.
 9. **WATERWORKS MECHANIC SUPERVISOR**
James ARNY and Michael COSENZA, Senior Waterworks Mechanic Supervisor, Department of Water & Power.

File No. 56070

- c. Approve the change of the test of fitness method in the interdepartmental promotional examination for **Personnel Records Supervisor**. The examination will consist of a qualifying multiple-choice test and a weighted interview (100%).

File No. 56071

- d. Approve the change of the test of fitness method in the open and promotional examination for **Senior Benefits Analyst**. The examination will consist of an advisory essay and a weighted interview (100%).

File No. 56072

10. **CLASSIFICATION ACTIONS**

- a. The General Manager recommends that the Board of Civil Service Commissioners approve the following Classification actions:

1. Allocate the following new positions in the **Water System** of the **Department of Water & Power**, as indicated:

<u>DWP No.</u>	<u>No. of Positions</u>	<u>DDR No.</u>	<u>Class Title and Code</u>
7125	2	95-75542	Mechanical Engineering Associate, 7554
7143	1	93-13641	Senior Administrative Clerk, 1368
7144	1	95-72463	Civil Engineering Associate, 7246
7145	1	95-72462	Civil Engineering Associate, 7246
7149	1	95-94063	Managing Water Utility Engineer, 9406
7150	1	95-94065	Managing Water Utility Engineer, 9406

2. Allocate the following new positions in the **Joint System** of the **Department of Water & Power**, as indicated:

<u>DWP No.</u>	<u>No. of Positions</u>	<u>DDR No.</u>	<u>Class Title and Code</u>
7146	2	82-17001	Management Analyst, 9184
7147	1	95-91053	Utility Administrator, 9105
7148	1	91-31001	Security Officer, 3181
7151	1	94-72109	Civil Engineering Drafting Technician, 7232
7154	2	93-31022	Custodian, 3156
7161	4	94-11030	Systems Administrator, 1455
7162	1	94-15018	Systems Analyst, 1596

3. Allocate the following new positions in the **Power System** of the **Department of Water & Power**, as indicated:

<u>DWP No.</u>	<u>No. of Positions</u>	<u>DDR No.</u>	<u>Class Title and Code</u>
7152	1	94-12116	Principal Clerk Utility, 1202
7153	1	72-72073	Civil Engineering Drafting Technician, 7232
7155	1	94-75301	Mechanical Engineer, 7558
7156	1	94-75301	Mechanical Engineer, 7558
7157	2	94-38177	Senior Electrical Mechanic Supervisor, 3836

4. Allocate the following new positions in the **Harbor Department**, as indicated:

<u>CSC No.</u>	<u>No. of Positions</u>	<u>Class Title and Code</u>
4052	1	Locksmith, 3393
4053	1	Public Relations Specialist, 1785

5. Reallocate the following positions in the **Personnel Department**, as indicated:

<u>CSC No.</u>	<u>No. of Positions</u>	<u>From:</u> <u>Class Title and Code</u>	<u>To:</u> <u>Class Title and Code</u>
4054	1	Management Analyst, 9184	Sr. Management Analyst, 9171

File No. 56073

10 **CLASSIFICATION ACTIONS, (Continued)**

- b. The Interim General Manager recommends that the Board of Civil Service Commissions:
1. Reallocate two (2) positions in the class of **Utility Administrator**, Class Code 9105 in the Department of Water & Power into the new class of **Senior Benefits Analyst**, Class Code 9109;
 2. Find the individuals listed below with status in the class of **Utility Administrator** to be “legally employed” in the class of **Senior Benefits Analyst**, Class Code 9109 in the Department of Water & Power, with assignment rights only to the positions properly allocable to the class in which they currently have status;

<u>NAME</u>	<u>CLASS TITLE AND CODE</u>
MEJIA, DAISY	UTILITY ADMINISTRATOR, 9105
SUN, SHUYI	UTILITY ADMINISTRATOR, 9105
 3. Approve the use of a status exam so that the named individuals may obtain status in the class of **Senior Benefits Analyst**, Class Code 9109.

File No. 56074

- c. The Interim General Manager recommends that the Board of Civil Service Commissions:
1. Reallocate four (4) positions in the class of **Management Analyst**, Class Code 9184 in the Department of Water & Power into the new class of **Benefits Analyst**, Class Code 9108;
 2. Find the individuals listed below, with status in the class of **Management Analyst** “legally employed” in the class of **Benefits Analyst**, Class Code 9108 in the Department of Water & Power, with assignment rights only to the positions properly allocable to the class in which they currently have status;

<u>NAME</u>	<u>CLASS TITLE AND CODE</u>
BRAGANZA, PATRICK	MANAGEMENT ANALYST, 9184
GONZALEZ-GIACHETTI, PAMELA	MANAGEMENT ANALYST, 9184
MAH, KENDRICK	MANAGEMENT ANALYST, 9184
TRAN, KIMLOAN THI	MANAGEMENT ANALYST, 9184
 3. Approve the use of a status exam so that the named individuals may obtain status in the class of **Benefits Analyst**, Class Code 9108.

File No. 56075

- d. The Interim General Manager recommends that the Board of Civil Service Commissioners give 10-day notice of intention to:
1. Create the new classification of **Data Scientist**, Class Code 1469.
and
 2. Adopt the new Class Specification for **Data Scientist**, 1469.

File No. 56076

10. **CLASSIFICATION ACTIONS, (Continued)**

- e. The Interim General Manager recommends that the Board of Civil Service Commissioners give 10-day' notice of intention to:
 - 1. Create the new classification of **Director of Continuous Improvement**, Class Code 9603.
and
 - 2. Adopt the new Class Specification for **Director of Continuous Improvement**, 9603.
File No. 56077

- f. The Interim General Manager recommends that the Board of Civil Service Commissioners give a 10-day' notice of intention to:
 - 1. Create the new classification of **Organizational Change Manager**, Class Code 9111.
and
 - 2. Adopt the new Class Specification for **Organizational Change Manager**, 9111.
File No. 56078

- g. The Interim General Manager recommends that the Board of Civil Service Commissioners give 10 days' notice of intention to:
 - 1. Create the new classification of **Industrial Engineering Associate**, Class Code 7231.
and
 - 2. Adopt the new Class Specifications for **Industrial Engineering Associate**, Class Code 7231.
File No. 56079

COMMISSION ACTION: RECOMMENDATIONS APPROVED

11. **ADJOURNMENT**

The meeting was adjourned at 11:44 a.m. without objection, on a motion by Commissioner Gould, seconded by Commissioner McClelland.

Guy Lipa

GUY LIPA,
Commission President

Bruce E. Whidden

BRUCE E. WHIDDEN,
Commission Executive Director