



# CITY OF LOS ANGELES BOARD OF CIVIL SERVICE COMMISSIONERS

## MINUTES

COMMISSIONERS

JEANNE A. FUGATE  
President

RAUL PEREZ  
Vice President

ERICA L. JACQUEZ  
NANCY P. MCCLELLAND  
VACANT  
Commissioners

REGULAR MEETING  
THURSDAY, JUNE 13, 2019 – 10:00 A.M.  
ROOM 350, PERSONNEL BUILDING  
700 EAST TEMPLE STREET  
LOS ANGELES, CALIFORNIA 90012

As a covered entity under Title II of the Americans with Disabilities Act, the City of Los Angeles does not discriminate on the basis of disability and, with notice of 72 hours, will provide reasonable accommodation (assistive listening devices, sign language interpretation, and translation services) to ensure equal access to its programs, services and activities.

Digital recordings of Commission Board meetings are kept for 30 days after each meeting. Information on acquiring an audio copy of a meeting may be obtained by contacting the Commission Office at (213) 473-9107. Website: <http://www.lacity.org>

Present:

President Jeanne A. Fugate  
Commissioner Erica L. Jacquez  
Commissioner Nancy P. McClelland

General Manager Wendy Macy  
Deputy City Attorney: Jennifer Glenn  
Commission Executive Director  
Bruce Whidden

Absent:

Vice President Raul Perez

1. **CALL TO ORDER**

The Commission President called the meeting to order at 10:05 a.m.

2. **APPROVAL OF MINUTES**

- a. Unanimous approval of the minutes of the regular meeting of Thursday, March 14, 2019, on a motion by Commissioner McClelland, seconded by Commissioner Jacquez.
- b. Unanimous approval of the minutes of the regular meeting of Thursday, April 11, 2019, on a motion by Commissioner McClelland, seconded by Commissioner Jacquez.

3. **PUBLIC COMMENTS ON MATTERS WITHIN BOARD'S JURISDICTION**

Thomas Anderberry

4. **COMMISSION ACTION ON ROUTINE AND OTHER MATTERS**

Unanimous approval of routine and nonappearance matters under Unfinished Business, page five, item 8 and New Business, pages six through 12, items 9 and 10, as amended, on a motion by Commissioner McClelland, seconded by Commissioner Jacquez.

5. GENERAL MANAGER'S REPORT

The General Manager announced the passing for former Personnel Department General Manager Maggie Whelan on June 6, 2019. Maggie served the City for more than 47 years, 14 of which as General Manager of the Personnel Department. An acknowledged international leader in the field of Human Resources, Maggie was an active member, even after retirement of the International Public Management Association for Human Resources (IPMA-HR) and was an IPMA-HR Certified Professional, a regular contributor to the IPMA-HR monthly magazine, *HR News* and she has also penned a chapter in the book Leadership Secrets of Local Government Human Resource Officials. Maggie served for six years on the organization's Executive Council, being elected its President in 2010. As President, Maggie's expertise and influence moved beyond the bounds of the United States into the international arena, representing IPMA in many conferences in London, Beijing, Dubai, and Canada. For her broad scope of accomplishment and ground-breaking insight in her field, she was presented the Muriel M. Morse Achievement Award by the Western Region of IPMA-HR, the highest honor her colleagues in her region could bestow. She will be greatly missed.

6. APPEALS UNDER CHARTER SECTION 1016

- a. **Gerardo MORALES**, Equipment Mechanic, Department of General Services. Discharge effective November 9, 2018.

Report and recommendations of the Board’s Hearing Examiner Craig Renetzky following the conduct of a hearing in the Appellant’s absence on April 4, 2019 into the appeal of Mr. Morales.

The Hearing Examiner recommends that the Board:

A. FIND that the *Skelly* due process requirements were met.

- 1) SUSTAIN the cause of action of theft of City property;
- 2) SUSTAIN the cause of action of violation of Safety Rules or practices, which endanger the employee or others or damages City property or equipment.

B. FIND that the Discharge effective November 9, 2018 was appropriate and is SUSTAINED.

C. MAKE A DETERMINATION to adopt the findings and conclusions in the Hearing Examiner’s report as its own.

File No. 55212

COMMISSION ACTION:

***Discussion:***

The Department Representative noted their concurrence with the findings and recommendations in the Hearing Examiner’s report and asked the Board to adopt it and uphold the discipline.

The Appellant did not attend the meeting of the Board

***Commission Action:***

In a series of motions by Commissioner McClelland, seconded by Commissioner Jacquez, the Board voted unanimously to:

FIND that the *Skelly* due process requirements were met.

SUSTAIN the cause of action of theft of City property;

SUSTAIN the cause of action of violation of Safety Rules or practices, which endanger the employee or others or damages City property or equipment.

FIND that the Discharge effective November 9, 2018 was appropriate and is SUSTAINED.

ADOPT the findings and conclusions in the Hearing Examiner’s report as its own.

**Appearances**

Dan Yoshimura, Director, Liaison Services Bureau, Division III, Personnel Department

Thomas Trujillo, Liaison Services Division III, for the Department of General Services

The Appellant did not attend the Commission Board meeting

6. APPEALS UNDER CHARTER SECTION 1016

b. **Tanya Marie SENIOR**, Security Officer, Department of Airports. Suspension effective November 6, 2017 to November 22, 2017, inclusive, (12-working days).

Report and recommendations of the Board’s Hearing Examiner Craig Renetzky following the conduct of a hearing in the Appellant’s absence on February 19, 2019 into the appeal of Ms. Senior.

The Hearing Examiner recommends that the Board:

A. FIND that the *Skelly* due process requirements were met.

- 1) SUSTAIN the cause of action of a violation of Airport Manual 5.020.C-3 Attendance and tardiness – Leaving assigned work location without approval;
- 2) SUSTAIN the cause of action of a violation of Airport Manual 5.020.B-1 Use of privately owned vehicle while on duty.
- 3) SUSTAIN the cause of action of a violation of Airport Manual 5.050.G-5 Fraud, dishonesty or falsification of records.

B. FIND that the Suspension effective November 6, 2017 to November 22, 2017, inclusive, (12-working days), was appropriate and is SUSTAINED.

C. MAKE A DETERMINATION to adopt the findings and conclusions in the Hearing Examiner’s report as its own.

File No. 55212

COMMISSION ACTION:

***Discussion:***

The Department expressed its agreement with the Hearing

6. **APPEALS UNDER CHARTER SECTION 1016, (Continued)**

- c. **Diana Y. PORTILLO**, Traffic Officer II, Department of Transportation. Discharge effective May 8, 2018.

Report and recommendations of the Board's Hearing Examiner Silvia Marks-Barnett following the conduct of hearings held on August 28, 2018, December 10, 2018 and January 24, 2019 into the subject appeal of Ms. Portillo.

The Hearing Examiner recommends that the Board:

- A. FIND that the *Skelly* due process provisions were met.
- 1) SUSTAIN the cause of action of misconduct, on or off the job, seriously reflecting on City employment or employees;
  - 2) SUSTAIN the cause of action of engaging in illegal behavior in conflict with job duties, on or off the job;
- B. FIND that the Discharge effective May 8, 2018 was appropriate and is SUSTAINED.
- C. MAKE A DETERMINATION to adopt the findings and conclusions in the Hearing Examiner's report as its own.

File No. 55031

COMMISSION ACTION:

7. **RESIGNATIONS, SETTLEMENTS AND WITHDRAWALS UNDER CHARTER SECTION 1016 TO BE MADE A MATTER OF RECORD**

**Synthia GORDON**, Commercial Service Supervisor, Department of Water & Power. Suspension effective March 11, 2019 to March 22, 2019, inclusive, (10-working days). Settlement agreement between the City and Synthia Gordon whereby the Department agreed to reduce the ten (10) working day suspension imposed to a two (2) working day suspension. The Department agreed to make the Appellant whole for the days of suspension already served. The Appellant agreed to withdraw her Appeal from Suspension now pending before the Civil Service Commission. The parties agreed to other terms and conditions. The signed Settlement documents and the Appellant's Withdrawal from Appeal form were received in the office of the Civil Service Commission on May 15, 2019.

File No. 55262

COMMISSION ACTION: MADE A MATTER OF RECORD

8. ADMINISTRATIVE ACTIONS

The General Manager recommends that:

- a. Pursuant to Civil Service Rule 4.2, the Board shall make the significant changes in the following bulletins promulgated on the date noted a matter of record:

May 17, 2019

Interdepartmental Promotional and Open Competitive

ART CENTER DIRECTOR

Interdepartmental Promotional

ENVIRONMENTAL ENGINEER

May 24, 2019

Open Competitive

AQUATIC FACILITY MANAGER

PILE DRIVER WORKER

SPECIAL INVESTIGATOR

May 31, 2019

Interdepartmental Promotional and Open Competitive

ROOFER

- b. Make a matter of record the General Manager's recommendation to approve the use of the following Special Examining Assistants:

1) ART CENTER DIRECTOR

Jeffrey HERR, Arts Manager II and Benjamin JOHNSON, Performing Arts Director, Department of Cultural Affairs.

2) CHIEF ADMINISTRATIVE ANALYST

Yolanda CHAVEZ and Patricia HUBER, Assistant City Administrative Officers, Office of the City Administrative Officer.

3) CHIEF CONSTRUCTION INSPECTOR

Roberto LOYA, Airport Manager III, Department of Airports and Chris SMITH, Assistant Director, Department of Public Works, Bureau of Contract Administration.

4) CHIEF INFORMATION SECURITY OFFICER

Anthony MOORE, Assistant General Manager, Information Technology Agency and Aura MOORE, Chief Information Officer, Department of Airports.

5) CIVIL ENGINEERING DRAFTING TECHNICIAN

Genevieve HAN and Salman SUFI, Civil Engineering Associates III, Steve VASQUEZ, Senior Civil Engineering Drafting Technician and Michael LUNNEN, Principal Civil Engineering Drafting Technician, Department of Water & Power and Andrew ASFOUR and Richard LIU, Civil Engineers, Department of Public Works, Bureau of Engineering.

6) CONSTRUCTION ESTIMATOR

David COPP, Senior Civil Engineer, Department of Public Works, Bureau of Engineering and Tom DE SMET, Construction and Maintenance Superintendent, Department of Water & Power.

Continued...

8. **ADMINISTRATIVE ACTIONS, (Continued)**

b. Make a matter of record the General Manager's recommendation to approve the use of the following Special Examining Assistants, (Continued):

7) **ENVIRONMENTAL COMPLIANCE INSPECTOR**

Katrina MONTGOMERY-ACEVEDO, Stephen ORTEGA, Diana ZARATE-BARBOSA, Pamela BOND, Thomas BALES, William ANDREWS and Carolyn COOK, Environmental Compliance Inspectors, Department of Public Works, Bureau of Sanitation, Francisco BERBERABE, Senior Environmental Engineer, Department of Public Works, Board of Public Works.

8) **ENVIRONMENTAL SPECIALIST**

J. Lisa CARLSON, Environmental Supervisor II, Department of Public Works, Bureau of Sanitation.

9) **GALLERY ATTENDANT**

Steven WONG, Art Curator, Department of Cultural Affairs.

10) **LANDSCAPE ARCHITECTURAL ASSOCIATE**

Tom GIBSON, Landscape Architect II, Department of Recreation and Parks, Richard FISHER, Landscape Architect I, Department of Public Works, Bureau of Engineering and Lorena MATOS, Landscape Architect I, Department of Public Works, Bureau of Sanitation.

11) **MACHINIST**

Santiago BRIONES, Machinist Supervisor, Department of Water & Power and Robert DAY, Welder Supervisor, Department of General Services.

12) **MECHANICAL HELPER**

Anthony MASTROLIA, Equipment Repair Supervisor, Los Angeles Fire Department.

13) **METER READER**

Alejandro BEJARANO and Andwele WILLIAMS, Commercial Field Supervisors, Department of Water & Power.

14) **PERFORMING ARTS PROGRAM COORDINATOR**

Anna CROSS, Manager, Yucaipa Performing Arts Center and Carolyn ELLIOTT, Senior Director of Programming, The Broad Stage, Santa Monica.

15) **PHARMACIST**

Ernst MORGAN, Fire Captain I and Anthony HARDAWAY, Fire Battalion Chief, Los Angeles Fire Department.

16) **PLUMBING INSPECTOR**

Dexter Ron JACKSON and Joseph NICOSIA, Senior Plumbing Inspectors, Department of Building and Safety.

17) **PRINCIPAL PARK SERVICES ATTENDANT**

Joanne ULBRICH, Park Services Supervisor, Department of Recreation and Parks and Avo DAVIDIAN, Senior Management Analyst II, Zoo Department.

18) **PROGRAMMER ANALYST**

Jayson JOSEPH, Information Systems Manager I, Information Technology Agency, Fabian RAYGOSA, Information Systems Manager I, Department of Airports and James WANG, Programmer Analyst, Department of Water & Power.

19) **REPROGRAPHICS OPERATOR**



Raymond ZABALA, Reprographics Supervisor I, Department of Public Works, Bureau of Engineering and Troy D. JONES, Reprographics Operator, Department of Water & Power.

8. ADMINISTRATIVE ACTIONS, (Continued)

- b. Make a matter of record the General Manager’s recommendation to approve the use of the following Special Examining Assistants, (Continued):

20) ROOFER

Eugene JOHNSTON, Building Repair Supervisor, Department of Water & Power and Leslie WASHINGTON, Roofer Supervisor, Harbor Department.

21) SANITATION SOLID RESOURCES MANAGER

Traci MINAMIDE, Assistant Director and Lisa MOWERY, Chief Financial Officer, Department of Public Works, Bureau of Sanitation.

22) SENIOR ANIMAL KEEPER

Dorothy BELANGER, Principal Animal Keeper and Michael J. MAXCY, Zoo Curator, Zoo Department.

23) SENIOR STREET SERVICES INVESTIGATOR

Gary HARRIS, Chief Street Services Investigator II and David RIVERA, Chief Street Services Investigator I, Department of Public Works, Bureau of Street Services.

24) STREET SERVICES GENERAL SUPERINTENDENT

Keith MOZEE and Stephanie CLEMENTS, Assistant Directors, Department of Public Works, Bureau of Street Services.

File No. 55303

- c. Make a matter of record the General Manager’s action in approving the use of the following rater for the evaluation of Training and Experience Questionnaires for the following examination:

STAFF ASSISTANT TO GENERAL MANAGER WATER AND POWER

Sharon GROVE, Assistant General Manager, Department of Water and Power.

File No. 55304

- d. Approve the change of the test of fitness method in the interdepartmental promotional and open competitive examination for **Supervising Transportation Planner**. The examination will be comprised of a qualifying online multiple-choice test, online advisory essay, and an interview weighted at (100%).

File No. 55305

- e. Approve the change of the test of fitness method in the interdepartmental promotional examination for **Senior Detention Officer**. The examination will be comprised of a 50% essay and a 50% interview.

File No. 55306

8. **ADMINISTRATIVE ACTIONS, (Continued)**

f. Make the following APPEALS a matter of record:

Suspension

**AIRPORT POLICE SERGEANT**, Department of Airports. Suspension effective May 23, 2019 to May 31, 2019, inclusive (8-working days). Form 77 filed with Records, May \_\_, 2019.

Cause of Action: 1) Violation of Airport Admin Code 5.020 B-1 & Airport Police 16/5.1 Section G (a): handling of recovered money after authentication of ownership;  
2) Violation of Airport Admin Code 5.020 B-6: failure to carry out supervisory responsibilities adequately;

Discipline: Suspension effective May 23, 2019 to May 31, 2019, inclusive (8-working days).

In accordance with Charter Section 1016, the Appellant filed an appeal by email with the Office of the Commission on May 20, 2019.

File No. 55307

**Aaron YAMAMOTO**, Airport Supervisor of Operations, Department of Airports. Suspension effective May 15, 2019 to June 19, 2019, inclusive (20-working days). Form 77 filed with Records, May 29, 2019.

Cause of Action: 1) Violation of Airport Admin Code 5.020 B-1 & B-7: failure to remain alert and responsive on duty;  
2) Violation of Airport Admin Code 5.020 F-2 & F-3: causing to contributing to an accident by operating equipment in an unsafe manner;  
3) Violation of safety rules and practices which endangered the employee or others or damaged City property or equipment.

Discipline: Suspension effective May 15, 2019 to June 19, 2019, inclusive (20-working days).

In accordance with Charter Section 1016, the Appellant filed an appeal by email with the Office of the Commission on May 17, 2019.

File No. 55308

Discharge

**Frank PAZASIS**, Senior Management Analyst, Los Angeles Police Department. Discharge effective May 25, 2019. Form 77 filed with Records, May \_\_, 2019.

Cause of Action: 1) Between March 19, 2018 and April 27, 2017, the employee, while on duty, on numerous occasions, failure to accurately reflect work status on the Daily Sign-In Sheet;  
2) On or About July 20, 2018, the employee, while on duty, gave false statements to a sergeant when claiming he had previous permission by two lieutenants to sign in on the daily sign-in sheet at the time he arrived at the broken elevator.

Discipline: Discharge effective May 25, 2019.

In accordance with Charter Section 1016, the Appellant filed an appeal by email with the Office of the Commission on May 24, 2019.

File No. 55309

8. **ADMINISTRATIVE ACTIONS, (Continued)**

f. Make the following APPEALS a matter of record, (Continued):

Discharge, (Continued)

**Gabriela ZARATE**, Senior Administrative Clerk, Housing and Community Investment Department. Discharge effective May 14, 2019. Form 77 filed with Records, May \_\_, 2019.

Cause of Action: 1) Theft of or aiding in the theft of cash or City property or equipment, as established by proper investigation;  
2) Engaging in unethical conduct unbecoming a City employee.

Discipline: Discharge effective May 14, 2019.

In accordance with Charter Section 1016, the Appellant filed an appeal by email with the Office of the Commission on May 15, 2019.

File No. 55310

f. Make the following NOTICES a matter of record:

Suspensions

**POLICE SERVICE SPECIALIST**, Los Angeles Police Department. Form 77 filed with Records, May 15, 2019.

Cause of Action: 1) On or about August 26, 2018, the employee, while off-duty, inappropriately responded to a fellow employee's workplace and verbally harassed and followed him;  
2) On or about August 26, 2018, the employee, while off-duty, inappropriately pushed another;  
3) On or about August 26, 2018, the employee, while off-duty, inappropriately identified himself as a peace officer.

Discipline: Suspension effective June 6, 2019 to June 12, 2019 (6-working days).

**SECURITY OFFICER**, Department of Airports. Form 77 filed with Records, May 29, 2019.

Cause of Action: 1) Violation of Airport Admin Code 5.020 A.5: engaging in conduct in conflict with job duties, on or off the job;  
2) Violation of Airport Admin Code 5.020 B-1: conduct unbecoming an Airport Police Division employee;  
3) Violation of Airport Admin Code 5.020 B-3: misuse or failure to use delegated authority in the performance of duties;  
4) Violation of Airport Admin Code 5.020 D-1: initiating a confrontation with the public.

Discipline: Suspension effective May 12, 2019 to June 4, 2019, inclusive (15-working days), to be served as agreed.

COMMISSION ACTION: MADE A MATTER OF RECORD

**9. CLASSIFICATION ACTIONS**

a. The General Manager recommends that the Board approve the following Classification actions:

1. Allocate the following new positions for the **Library Department**, as indicated:

<u>CSC No.</u>	<u>No. of Positions</u>	<u>Class Title and Code</u>
3264	<u>1</u>	Management Analyst, 9184

2. Allocate the following new positions in the Joint System of the **Department of Water & Power**, as indicated:

<u>DWP No.</u>	<u>No. of Positions</u>	<u>DDR No.</u>	<u>Class Title and Code</u>
<u>5538</u>	<u>1</u>	<u>95-73103</u>	<u>Environmental Specialist, 7310</u>
<u>5539</u>	<u>2</u>	<u>95-91093</u>	<u>Senior Benefits Analyst, 9109</u>

3. Allocate the following new positions in the Water System of the Department of Water and Power, as indicated:

<u>DWP No.</u>	<u>No. of Positions</u>	<u>DDR No.</u>	<u>Class Title and Code</u>
5540	1	94-72050	Land Surveying Assistant, 7283
5541	1	93-39129	Water Utility Supervisor, 3976

4. Allocate the following new positions in the **City Planning Department**, as indicated:

<u>CSC No.</u>	<u>No. of Positions</u>	<u>Class Title and Code</u>
3267	1	Senior City Planner, 7947
3268	1	City Planner, 7944
3269	1	City Planning Associate, 7941
3270	1	Management Analyst, 9184
3271	1	Senior Administrative Clerk, 1368
3272	1	Administrative Clerk, 1358

5. Allocate the following new position in the **Harbor Department**, as indicated:

<u>CSC No.</u>	<u>No. of Positions</u>	<u>Class Title and Code</u>
3263	1	Fiscal Systems Specialist, 1555

6. Allocate the following new position in the **Housing and Community Investment Department**, as indicated:

<u>CSC No.</u>	<u>No. of Positions</u>	<u>Class Title and Code</u>
3277	1	Management Analyst, 9184

7. Reallocate the following position in the **Personnel Department**, as indicated:

<u>CSC No.</u>	<u>No. of Positions</u>	<u>From:</u>	<u>To:</u>
<u>No.</u>	<u>Positions</u>	<u>Class Title and Code</u>	<u>Class Title and Code</u>
3273	1	Personnel Analyst, 1731	Senior Personnel Analyst, 9167

8. Reallocate the following position in the **Department of Animal Services**, as indicated:

<u>CSC No.</u>	<u>No. of Positions</u>	<u>From:</u>	<u>To:</u>
<u>No.</u>	<u>Positions</u>	<u>Class Title and Code</u>	<u>Class Title and Code</u>
<u>3274</u>	<u>1</u>	Administrative Clerk, 1358	<u>Sr. Administrative Clerk, 1368</u>

9. **CLASSIFICATION ACTIONS, (Continued)**

a. The General Manager recommends that the Board approve the following Classification actions, (Continued):

9. Reallocate the following position in the **Department of Recreation and Parks**, as indicated:

<u>CSC No.</u>	<u>No. of Positions</u>	<u>From:</u> <u>Class Title and Code</u>	<u>To:</u> <u>Class Title and Code</u>
3275	<u>1</u>	<u>Secretary, 1116</u>	<u>Executive Administrative Assistant, 1117</u>

File No. 55311

b. The General Manager recommends that the Board approve the following Classification actions in connection with the 2019-2020 Budget, effective July 1, 2019.

1. Allocate the following positions:

<u>CSC No.</u>	<u>No. of Positions</u>	<u>Department</u> <u>Class Title and Code</u>
		<b><u>LOS ANGELES DEPARTMENT OF CONVENTION AND TOURISM DEVELOPEMENT</u></b>
19/20-006	1	Senior Administrative Clerk, 1368
		<b><u>LIBRARY DEPARTMENT</u></b>
19/20-001	1	Senior Administrative Clerk, 1368
19/20-002	1	Senior Gardener, 3143
19/20-003	2	Gardener Caretaker, 3141
19/20-004	2	Maintenance Laborer, 3112

2. Reallocate the following positions:

<u>CSC No.</u>	<u>No. of Positions</u>	<u>From:</u> <u>Class Title and Code</u>	<u>To:</u> <u>Class Title and Code</u>
		<b><u>LIBRARY DEPARTMENT</u></b>	
19/20-005	1	Storekeeper, 1835	Senior Storekeeper, 1837

File No. 55312

c. The General Manager recommends that the Board of Civil Service Commissioners:

(a) Allocate the following new position in the **Department of Recreation and Parks**;

and

(b) Exempt the following position in accordance with Charter Section 1001(d)(4), based on the position being grant-funded for a term not to exceed two years.

<u>CSC No.</u>	<u>No. of Positions</u>	<u>Class Title and Code</u>
3276	1	Electrician Supervisor, 3865

File No. 55313

COMMISSION ACTION:

10. **ADJOURNMENT**

The Meeting was adjourned by the Commission President at 1\_:\_\_ a.m.

---

JEANNE FUGATE,  
President

---

BRUCE E. WHIDDEN,  
Commission Executive Director