

**CITY OF LOS ANGELES
BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 4, 2012**

DRAFT

The Regular Meeting of the Board of Fire Commissioners convened at 9:38 a.m. in the Fire Commission Meeting Room, City Hall East, 200 N. Main Street, Room 1820, Los Angeles.

• **ROLL CALL**

Present: President Genethia Hudley-Hayes
Commissioner Steven Fazio
Commissioner Andrew Friedman
Commissioner Alan Skobin
Fire Chief Brian Cummings
Assistant City Attorney Carlos De La Guerra

Absent: Vice President Casimiro Tolentino

• **FLAG SALUTE AND MOMENT OF SILENCE**

The flag salute was followed by a moment of silence in honor of past and present members of the Los Angeles Fire Department, the fire service, law enforcement, EMS and the military who devote their lives to the protection of the community and of our Country.

1. ITEMS NOTICED FOR PUBLIC HEARING – taken out of order (vote taken after Item 8)

- A. [BFC 12-103] – Establishment of Film Fire Safety Officer – proposed fee:
1. Approve the proposed Film Fire Safety Officer Fee of \$64 per hour.
 2. Draft an ordinance to [amend] the Los Angeles Municipal Code (L.A.M.C.), Chapter 5, Article 7, to establish the new classification of Film Fire Safety Officer.
(Please refer to report for complete details.)

Fire Marshal Mark Stormes requested a change to Recommendation 1, as directed by the Office of the City Administrative Officer, adding “with four hour minimum. Reference 57.01.32.”

MOTION (Skobin/Friedman): That the Board approve the report with a change to verbiage on Recommendation 1. Add “with four hour minimum. Reference 57.01.32.”

APOPTED: AYES – 4 (Absent: Tolentino)

2. COMMISSION COMMENTS

President Genethia Hudley-Hayes thanked the Fire Department for the kind service that she received. For the first time, in her entire career as a Commissioner, she was a recipient of Fire Department services. She got sick following the last Commission meeting and was transported from the Board room to Kaiser. The service that she received, which she knows is consistent with everyone who receives services from the Fire Department, was superior and professional. She commended the Rescue [Unit] from Fire Station 4.

President Hudley-Hayes continued and stated her sister was transported on Friday, it was also her sister's first time being transported, and the consistency was that her sister received the same kind of professional service that she received. President Hudley-Hayes thanked Battalion Chief Allen Norman who came with her.

President Hudley-Hayes thanked Commissioner Friedman and Commissioner Skobin for their support during the incident. Commissioner Friedman commented he hoped it never happened to her again.

Commissioner Skobin stated that was part of a test because he wants to see how long it takes for them to send her the bill. President Hudley-Hayes stated whatever the bill is, it is worth it.

President Hudley-Hayes commented that during the Labor-Management meeting an item came up that she would like to share with Commissioners. The Office of the City Administrative Officer wants to hire an outside consultant at a cost of \$500,000 (\$750,000 was reduced by Council to \$500,000) for a third-party review of the Department's deployment of resources. The analysis will include platoon duty and special duty staffing levels, the constant staffing deployment model, and response times of fire and emergency medical services citywide. She commented she is taking issue with this. We do not have enough to maintain our budget the way it is, but for some reason there is some unappropriated balance where they can find \$500,000 to have a consultant come and do what she thinks the Department can do well on its own. This is problematic for her.

President Hudley-Hayes requested a full discussion on this item at the September 20th meeting.

3. REPORT OF THE FIRE CHIEF

- Announcements/Meetings/Events
- Significant Incidents/Activities

1. [BFC 12-135] – Significant Incident Summary report for the period of August 8 through August 12, 2012.

ACTION: RECEIVED AND FILED.

Fire Chief Cummings referenced the Calendar of Events provided: September 9 & 16 – LAFD Battalion 18 & CERT Neighborhood Team Program Training Sessions; September 11 – Memorial Ceremonies will be held at several venues; September 12 – Opening for Latino Heritage Month; September 17 & 18 – Rosh Hashanah. Fire Chief Cummings reported September 5-7 he will attend the League of California Cities in San Diego; October 4-6 he will be in Quincy, Massachusetts, with the NFPA Urban Fire Forum; October 7 he will be in Emmetsburg as one of our fallen firefighters' name will be entered on the National Fallen Firefighters Memorial.

Commissioner Friedman stated he spoke with Chief Rueda regarding the preparedness for the Jewish holidays; every year in the past Chief Rueda has briefed him on it. He suggested in addition to briefing him, a briefing should go to all the Commissioners, particularly Commissioner Fazio and Commissioner Skobin because they also have some contact with synagogues and can advise them regarding the preparedness of the Fire Department for the Jewish holidays.

Deputy Chief Mario Rueda reported on three incidents that were outside the report:

- August 29 – 100-year-old gentleman backed his vehicle out of a driveway and injured nine children and two adults in the South Los Angeles area.
- Collision between our Metro Rail Blue Line and one of our Metro Rail Transit Buses on South San Pedro at Washington – 30 people were taken to the hospital. LAFD implemented Multi-Casualty Procedures.
- In the San Fernando Valley, two good Samaritans died while attempting to assist a victim of a traffic accident that hit a street light and a fire hydrant. The first woman that attempted to assist was electrocuted; a second good Samaritan attempted to assist her and was also electrocuted. Seven people were transported to the hospital. This incident has caused LAFD to look at some of their internal procedure and potentially the purchase of some additional equipment that can detect energized water in these instances. A "Lessons

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 4, 2012

DRAFT

Learned” document was posted on the information portal. Division 3 and Battalion 14 attended the service for one of the victims.

President Hudley-Hayes inquired regarding the Glendale fire and also the fire near Glendora, is LAFD providing any resources? Chief Rueda stated yesterday the Angeles National Forest requested the use of our helitanker. We bill them for those hours that the helitanker goes out and it is also near enough that LAFD can recall it if needed. President Hudley-Hayes asked if LAFD bills and gets the total amount back? Chief Rueda stated yes and also an administrative fee, full cost recovery.

Fire Chief Cummings stated the tragic incident with the electrocutions highlights the fact that LAFD provides first responder response capability for numerous City departments. Because we maintain that capability, the DWP does not need to have response capability. We had units on scene within 5 minutes of the initial 911 call; DWP arrived on scene about 50 minutes after LAFD. We are talking with DWP for cost recovery for that service (i.e., sheared hydrants, downed power lines and broken water mains). The 2010-11 analysis showed that all three of those [items] together came to close to \$6 million; also working with the Mayor’s Office regarding receiving cost recovery for LAFD providing that service.

Commissioner Skobin commented this morning he was briefed on the Administrative Services Bureau (ASB) and they looked at some of the revenue areas, i.e. Airports, Harbor, DWP; DWP was under \$2 million. Would this [item] require a new contract with DWP? Fire Chief Cummings stated probably, we would have to have some type of Letter of Agreement or contract; ASB has done all the staff work to show the amount of calls, hours, and resources used.

4. PRESENTATIONS

Ms. Jill Furillo, Fire Commissioner 2005-12.

President Hudley-Hayes commended Commissioner Furillo for her seven years of service and her lifelong work as a registered nurse, a trauma nurse, as an emergency room nurse, as a person who serves as part of the union activities for the California Nurses Association. Commissioner Furillo brought to this Commission a deep passion and understanding of the EMS work done by the LAFD. She along with Commissioner Friedman headed a subcommittee that looked at EMS processes, policies, and services, and she was able to bring about changes that made the Department better.

President Hudley-Hayes stated that without the amount of information/education that she learned from Commissioner Furillo, she would not have been as complete/informed a Commissioner in understanding what happens when resources get to an emergency room, length of time it takes our resources to be out of service before we can move patients from our resources into emergency room resources, and how that ties up staff.

President Hudley-Hayes stated Commissioner Furillo was one of the first who raised the issue of something that was going to be started and did not get started – the QuickLaunch - and thanked her for her focus on emergency services.

Commissioner Furillo stated it has been an honor to serve on the Commission for seven years, but based on her increased responsibilities when her organization became a national organization, it became impossible for her to continue to give the necessary attention that the City needs at this time with the resource issues. In her tenure, she was able to see the problem of hospital emergency rooms closing and how that work fell on the LAFD. The Department has done everything it can to try to meet the needs of the public given the current reality. She commended President Hudley-Hayes on her

leadership. She remains a strong advocate for medical services and for a health care system that does not rely upon profit, a system that would give care and access to everyone regardless of their ability to pay, medical services should not be dependent upon whether or not you are rich or poor. Everyone deserves healthcare.

President Hudley-Hayes presented Commissioner Furillo with a Certificate of Appreciation on behalf of the City of Los Angeles and the Commission.

Commissioner Friedman echoed President Hudley-Hayes' comments, stated he served with Commissioner Furillo on the EMS Subcommittee, and stated Commissioner Furillo demonstrated her focus for the safety of Los Angelenos and especially the EMS field. He thanked Commissioner Furillo for her service.

5. CONSENT AGENDA ITEMS - All Consent Agenda Items were called Special

A. [BFC 12-134] – Annual Report – LAFD CAL JAC – Account 40K Fiscal Year 2010/2011

Deputy Chief Roxanne Bercik stated the annual report noted limited expenditures during that time period as LAFD was starting to meet with UFLAC prior to the audit.

President Hudley-Hayes stated that in the audit received [Audit of the Training Agreement Between the LAFD and CFFJAC] the Controller mentioned that we had \$1.6 million in available program funds, but have not developed a spending plan or budget for those funds. Chief Bercik stated Chief Corey Rose could address that as they are working on those audit recommendations. This report is only the annual fiscal report for expenditures in 2010/2011; the audit-recommended changes are separate.

Chief Rose stated this is the current balance in the 40K Account and there is another balance in CAL JAC in Sacramento; together they both equal the \$1.6 million. They have met with UFLAC and there were 13 action items on the audit. They are preparing a Board report for the next Commission meeting to go through the audit and answer all the questions from the audit. President Hudley-Hayes asked if her question will be answered at the September 20 [special meeting]; Chief Rose stated yes and that he did not want to be too premature and answer questions regarding the audit when they have not given it to the Controller's Office yet.

Commissioner Alan Skobin stated he was confused; the Commission should get anything before it goes to the Controller's Office. Fire Chief Cummings stated that was correct, it will come to the Commission first.

President Hudley-Hayes stated she had three other questions and asked who she should give them to. Fire Chief Cummings stated they should be sent to Chief Deputy Daren Palacios and he will get them to the appropriate staff. President Hudley-Hayes asked Chief Palacios that her questions be listed in the report so the Commissioners can see the questions she has and make sure they get answered.

MOTION: See 5.D.

ACTION: APPROVED

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 4, 2012

DRAFT

B. BFC 12-136] – 2012-2013 Annual Organization Chart

Chief Palacios stated in preparing the report, staff works with the Office of the City Administrative Officer, they review eliminated and added positions and, upon Commission approval, it is put on the website.

Commissioner Skobin stated he is accustomed to seeing one sheet that indicates who does what, the Commission as the Head of the Department, and Fire Chief as the General Manager/Chief Engineer.

Ms. Cynthia White, Personnel Services Section, confirmed that the Department does receive a format for the organization chart.

Commissioner Skobin asked if there is one document the Commission could look at to look at the major components of the Department? Fire Chief Cummings stated that would be in our Volumes, our Manual of Operations just has a basic wire diagram organization chart that shows the major bureaus and what is under the major bureaus. This [BFC 12-136] is a City document to track all the positions.

Commissioner Skobin stated as we serve the public, it seems logical that we have an organizational chart with the major entities on the website for the public that gives a snapshot of the Fire Department. Fire Chief Cummings stated the one from Volume 1 is there already, but staff will follow-up and report back at the next Commission meeting. Commissioner Skobin encouraged LAFD to see what LAPD is using; the organization should also have access to that.

President Hudley-Hayes asked for clarification regarding the Deputy Chief Accountant II position which reports directly to the Fire Commission. Ms. White stated the position is on the organization chart as part of a required Ordinance, but reports directly to the Acting Fire Administrator, and is located on the chart as a staff support for the Commission.

Mr. Sal Martinez, Acting Fire Administrator, stated that part of the responsibility of the Deputy Chief Accountant is to ensure that all policies and accounting reports that are generated are approved by the Commission, i.e., audits, write-offs, and adjustments. He confirmed the person in the position is Ms. Carmela Espiritu. President Hudley-Hayes asked the meaning of OVR next to the Deputy Chief Accountant II position. Ms. White stated she would need to check.

President Hudley-Hayes inquired regarding the two vacant positions which report to the Employee Relations Officer. Ms. White confirmed both are new positions to the Department and they decided to obtain regular authorities to assist in the Risk Management Section. They are working on preparing a memo to send the two positions through the managed hiring process and fill the position.

President Hudley-Hayes asked if the person is not in the Risk Management Section; Ms. White stated no.

Chief Palacios stated they intend to bring it all together under the Risk Manager II, the Management Analyst II, the Battalion Chief; everyone will be listed in that section. Only nine months funding was received and as soon as that money is available they can select a Management Analyst II and a Risk Manager II. In their response to the Independent Assessor's litigation report, that the Risk Manager plays a big part in doing a lot of the things that address deficiencies found by the Independent Assessor. Ms. White confirmed it is a civilian position.

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 4, 2012

DRAFT

President Hudley-Hayes asked when is the response to the audit coming? Chief Palacios confirmed it would come back on September 20.

Commissioner Skobin stated he did not understand why the Deputy Chief Accountant II would be a direct report only to give the Commission information and would like to know what the City Ordinance says about that position. Mr. Martinez stated they could come back with a more thorough explanation on this issue at the next meeting. President Hudley-Hayes commented if the person directly reports information to the Commission, does that mean the Commission is able to directly direct that person. Commissioner Skobin agreed and asked is then the Commission responsible for that person? Chief Palacios stated it is a direct report to the Fire Administrator with an indirect report to the Commission. Commissioner Skobin added he would like to see what the authority is by which it should be assigned to the Commission.

Chief Palacios stated he had also seen the LAPD website that Commissioner Skobin referenced, which also contains photos, and LAFD is working towards that but need money and staff time to get to where we should be.

MOTION: See 5.D.

ACTION: MOVED TO SEPTEMBER 20, 2012.

C. BFC 12-137] – Elimination of Two Inspector II and Two Inspector I Sub-Authorities

Fire Marshal Stormes stated this report is to inform the Commission of the loss of four substitute authorities and the impacts on the Fire Prevention Bureau, Public Safety and Technical Sections. The Bureau assumed the four substitute authorities were going to be carried over, but the decision was made about six weeks into the fiscal year that they would not be continued.

Chief Stormes summarized the report provided and stated the net impact is about \$277,000 lost in revenue. Therefore, fees will have to be adjusted in CUPA and in the High Rise Unit. Commissioner Fazio stated if some of these items were paid for and self-funding, he does not understand why personnel would be reduced. Chief Stormes stated it has been his confusion for nearly three years.

Discussion was held regarding the need to repeatedly shut down areas, the need to change from a 12-month cycle to an 18-month cycle, the attempt to sustain the staffing in the fee supported areas, to achieve true full-fee recovery takes years of work, as the workload shifts workers are moved out of an area that is fully fee supported to support other areas being impacted, overall the Bureau is down about 23% in uniform staffing, and another person retired on Friday.

Commissioner Skobin asked in terms of safety, building quality, or crowd control, what do these positions mean and what is sacrificed in terms of public safety? Chief Stormes stated the one position at Staples Center is a subject matter expert on L.A. Live and the Staples Center. He was working one-on-one with their staff for a number of years, but the corporation felt it was not worth the benefit to that corporation. We will still provide coverage for all events, as needed, and staffing will be paid for as an additional overtime expense to that corporation

Commissioner Skobin asked what will we not be doing at the L.A. Live complex which we were doing? Fire Marshal stated L.A. Live will have to get in line and work through the normal process with their normal inspector; the inspector will not be onsite every work day. It is a matter of business convenience and productivity.

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 4, 2012

DRAFT

Chief Stormes stated for the other Inspector I position, 50% of his work day was high-rise inspections and the other half was specializing in asbestos abatement. He is taking the abatement work with him, but the remaining district that he is vacating will be closed in the high-rise unit. That workload will be equally distributed by the commander of high-rise unit among the other inspectors.

Commissioner Skobin stated he recognized that in high-rise there have been many code changes over the years, what are we giving up in terms of public safety by the change? Chief Stormes stated the workload is increasing for each of the [remaining] inspectors; therefore, the amount of time they can spend in the buildings is under constant pressure to keep moving forward. As needed in the past, he has detailed resources and inspectors from other areas, if for reasons of injuries, illness or vacant positions they have fallen behind, because it is a state mandate that we inspect every one of those buildings.

President Hudley-Hayes commented there is a negative impact and reference in the report regarding the responsibilities of the Inspector II for Environmental Unit, Underground Storage Tank (UST) Unit. Chief Stormes strongly agreed and stated it is a state mandate for the protection of the water table and the environment that they review all plan checks and modifications. That work will be shared by an Environmental Inspector and the two other members still assigned; it represents a 25% reduction in staffing. The HazMat Unit is 100% fee supported.

Chief Stormes stated due to some problems with the ability to collect permits and the fees, we are at about 86% of full cost recovery.

Discussion was held regarding the numerous negative impacts incurred in three years due to the Department's loss of 18 inspector positions. President Hudley-Hayes emphasized this [impact] could really present a danger to the City. She wants to create a single-subject ad hoc committee of one Commissioner to be the liaison with Chief Stormes to help the Commission get a better understanding; Commissioner Fazio agreed to be the liaison.

President Hudley-Hayes stated that the City needs to understand that we cannot keep asking the Fire Department to just do the work; these issues need to be brought to the Commission to make decisions about what the Commission's position might be about the elimination of some of these fundamental items. The correct language is to appoint Commissioner Fazio as the liaison to Fire Prevention for this one issue and for him to report back fully to the Commission in order to make a determination about what the Commission wants to happen with his recommendations.

Chief Stormes stated they are working with the Office of the City Administrative Officer to get the Inspector I's list done and efforts to go to Managed Hiring Committee.

Commissioner Skobin stated that another dimension that should be added to the discussion is that of the level of service provided to the public and provided several examples.

President Hudley-Hayes requested that the broader discussion regarding the impact of the elimination of positions and how that relates to the level of service provided to the public should be agendized for a future meeting.

MOTION: See 5.D.

ACTION: RECEIVED AND FILED.

- D. [BFC 12-139] – First Amendment to Agreement No. C-120424 between the Los Angeles Fire Department and Michael Baker for Consulting Services related to the Fire Station Alerting System

Mr. Bill Jones, Contracts and Grants Management Section, Administrative Services Bureau, provided the Commission background information on the original contract which came before the Commission in May 2012. He added that concurrent with that action, the City Council added \$250,000 to the Fire Department's budget specifically to continue the services of a Fire Station Alerting System consultant. Mr. Baker has worked in the area of fire station alerting systems and is a well-known expert in the field. The LAFD has been working closely with the Mayor's Office and the Information Technology Agency (ITA) to continue his services. Mr. Baker is focusing on the issues that are related to the evaluation and implementation of the Fire Station Alerting System; he is not an evaluator of the system. He is assisting the LAFD and the ITA Evaluation Team to understand the key components of the technologies that are associated with the Fire Station Alerting System as well as tying that information back to how a new fire station alerting system will interface with the existing Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD) system as well as any new CAD system the LAFD may employ in the future.

President Hudley-Hayes asked if the additional \$200,000 covered that increase of the services. Mr. Jones stated the \$200,000 is a ceiling, they are projecting that would be the limit to which Mr. Baker would be available for this year. President Hudley-Hayes asked if it occurred before or after the budget was approved. Mr. Jones stated the discussion for the amount was brought up during the budget hearings and was approved during the budget cycle.

Mr. Sal Martinez, Financial Services Division, Administrative Services Bureau, confirmed that initially the budget for the Fire Station Alerting System was put in the ITA's budget, plus some support, but now has been transferred into our account; the \$250,000 for the consultant was an add-on. The basic \$5 million for the Fire Station Alerting System was initially in ITA because it was MICLA funded and a line item in 2007-08. President Hudley-Hayes stated she needed to know where that money initially came from. Mr. Martinez stated he would do some research and see where that money initially came from and would report back at the September 20, 2012 Board meeting.

ACTION: MOVED TO SEPTEMBER 20, 2012.

MOTION (Friedman/Skobin): That the Board approve the report and recommendations for 5.A., that 5.B. and 5.D. be continued to September 20, and that 5.C. be received and filed.

APOPTED: AYES – 4 (Absent: Tolentino)

6. REGULAR AGENDA ITEMS

- A. Verbal report by Department on the disposition of LAFD matters considered by or referred to City Council/Committees during the period of August 22 through September 4, 2012.

Chief Vidovich reported on the following items:

At the August 24 Public Safety Committee meeting, the Committee approved the following items: 1) BFC and CAO reports relative to the transfer of funds in the amount of \$345,000 for the 2011 FEMA Urban Search and Rescue Taskforce Readiness Cooperative Agreement Grant (this item is scheduled for today at City Council); and 2) BFC report relative to a donation from the LAFD Foundation of 20 iPads, valued at \$16,000, for use by the Fire Department Administrative Battalion Chiefs on Special Duty (this item is scheduled for today at City Council).

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 4, 2012

DRAFT

In the past two weeks, a motion was introduced on August 28 by Councilmember Zine requesting that the CAO, CLA, the Fire Department and the Mayor's Office be requested to provide a verbal report back to the Public Safety Committee on the status of the Los Angeles Regional Interoperable Communications System (LA-RICS) Project which includes grant funding allocated for the project. LA-RICS was established as a collaborative effort of law enforcement, fire service, and health service professionals with elected and appointed officials working towards providing a single unified voice and data communications platform for all regional public safety agencies. The LA-RICS project was initiated largely as a result of the events of September 11 which highlighted the need for emergency personnel from different agencies and jurisdictions to be able to communicate with each other.

President Hudley-Hayes asked the portion of that report for which the Fire Department would be responsible. Chief Vidovich stated he is not sure; there is a pre-LA-RICS meeting scheduled for Wednesday. He will be able to report more in-depth at the next Commission meeting.

C. Verbal update by Department and Commission Liaison relative to the Information and Data Analysis (IDA) Task Force.

Assistant Chief Patrick Butler, Special Operations Division, Emergency Services Bureau, updated the Board on progress since the August 21 Commission meeting. He stated that progress continues and he would talk about the three data items on which they focused in the last week, and would also cover performance measurements and implementation. In terms of data accuracy, the subcommittee set out to establish clear standards and definitions to accurately calculate emergency response times as there are also non-emergency response times that sometimes get tabulated. Focusing on emergency response times, they established three teams and tasked each with an assignment. For example, teams that consist of internal/external stakeholders were tasked with calculating response times from the receipt of a 911 call at a LAFD Dispatch to the time the first unit arrives on scene. That would exclude all non-emergency calls and the time period used was July 1 through July 31, 2012.

Chief Butler stated the parameters were as follows: call received via 911, LAFD dispatcher, all emergency responses, first unit on scene. The results of the three teams were within about two seconds of each other. These were excellent results because it demonstrated that when clear response guidelines are established, and the same information was given to three separate groups, they essentially came back with the same answer. He added that regarding the one second and two second differences, they will drill down further into that data to look for patterns and anomalies to develop explanation of what is reasonable, what could potentially be human error and what are areas that can be fixed.

Chief Butler stated the second part of their accomplishment was that they have established an agreed upon standard for incident coding for emergency and non-emergency calls and also recommendations to address transitional calls, i.e. when a unit goes from emergency to non-emergency and vice versa. They will establish some recommendations that will move forward through the taskforce.

Chief Butler stated another aspect of emergency and non-emergency incident coding will be to look at past data and address those incidents that should be separated. They will also look at historical data to see if they can separate those [incidents]. Those were brought up in the Controller's audit and they will be looking at those as well.

Chief Butler stated the third area in data accuracy is programming changes and the flags that they have implemented in our Computer Aided Dispatch (CAD) System. Metro Fire

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 4, 2012

DRAFT

Communications has done a great job of doing some post-CAD data analysis. Daily Assistant Chief McCarthy monitors response times and any response time over six minutes will be flagged. They will set up the system to identify, trap and mitigate those data anomalies. They will then look at the timeline and if it does not have a reasonable explanation, then it may be a matter of training, policies, procedures or programming changes which we need to implement. Chief Butler stated in terms of performance measurements, the subcommittee met with the Bureau of Emergency Services last week. Chief Rueda talked about measurements performance in his Bureau and what are some areas that he would like to look at performance measurements. They also had a separate discussion that performance measurements also can lead to essentially gap analysis, i.e. areas we can improve. Two weeks ago they met in San Diego with members of the taskforce, with other public safety agencies, and shared best practices and performance metrics. Chief Butler stated he was able to meet with the senior leadership from the FDNY, Dallas Fire Department and Virginia Beach to discuss some of their best practices in technology and data management.

Chief Butler thanked the research advisors from USC and the Rand Corporation, the members of the taskforce who were meeting every week and Commissioner Skobin each for their individual leadership and dedication to the project.

Commissioner Skobin stated the taskforce is at a point where they see the light at the end of the tunnel. He is pleased and thanked Chief Butler for his day-to-day leadership, and he thanked Fire Chief Cummings for his support of the taskforce. They have been able to go to Chief Cummings as issues come up and have dialogue with him. The taskforce believes that the LAFD has the ability to accurately report response times, and part of that is having clear definitions of what they are measuring. They will be transparent with what they are measuring, and they are minimizing the impact of some human error. By looking at when the call is received by the LAFD to when the first unit arrives at the scene it becomes less important to know when the "en route" button is pressed, but we will measure that for other purposes.

Commissioner Skobin stated the taskforce will also look at the LAPD piece because the call goes into LAPD. It is also important to recognize that at this point we are dealing with are 911 calls. They are also developing some things they can do where the public can help us drive down response times, i.e. when possible, call 911 and another one is to use the landline. They will do some public education.

Commissioner Skobin stated the other piece which is critically important is the measurement. This is where we want to invite UFLAC to the table to work with us because we are in the process of identifying all those things that they feel should be measured in the Fire Department. They are developing that and some come from the accreditation that the Fire Chief wants. Commissioner Skobin hopes they can get some of the \$500,000 for the accreditation and also for some money for some people to implement it.

Commissioner Skobin stated the taskforce is also identifying what systems we have to capture the data. In closing, that will be the big issue and big win – of which response time is one piece. He conveyed his enthusiasm at the progress made, and he thanked the taskforce members, RAND in particular and Fire Chief Cummings.

President Hudley-Hayes asked for clarification regarding funding that is needed for what item. Commissioner Skobin stated he would like to see that the \$500,000 that Councilmember Englander played a role in obtaining for the Fire Department for an audit-type purpose. He would urge that it be used for the cost of doing the LAFD accreditation and for getting bodies to implement the measurement and accountability portion of what the taskforce is working on.

President Hudley-Hayes stated this is a part of what we would look at when talking about a business model, i.e. cost savings and efficiencies. She stated as opposed to a \$500,000 consultant, it appears to her that is a duplication of what the taskforce is doing, and he is saying that it could cost considerably less. Commissioner Skobin stated he believed our priorities are better placed, in the context of the taskforce, in the accreditation process and in personnel to implement the accountability portion the taskforce is working on. President Hudley-Hayes stated she believed the same, it is a much more effective use and much better way to look at the business model (efficiencies, effectiveness, etc.).

President Hudley-Hayes stated the broader implication for her, as discussed in Labor-Management Committee, is that there is also the possibility to be able to use data to begin to talk about why you cannot mix apples and oranges in terms of our constant staffing patterns. This would be a way to use the data to look at that. This Labor-Management group is doing better work than she has ever seen a labor-management group do in the seven years she has been on the Commission.

Commissioner Skobin stated the Palantir System, which was already contracted for, will have the ability to pull the CAD data as well as the other data they are looking at. The purpose of the data is to have discussion and dialogue about the data, how to improve it, what are best practices for comparison. It is important that the Department and its leaders fully understand that.

Chief Butler stated that in terms of accreditation, it is a wise place to invest our time and effort; Fire Chief Cummings has appointed an Accreditation Manager for the Department, Chief Drake. The advice from RAND and USC is invaluable because they are able to look at our issues/items from a different perspective. He added that they would drill deeper into the 1-2 second difference; a lot more analysis will occur.

Commissioner Skobin stated the taskforce would do as much as they reasonably can and will rely in large part on the statisticians at USC and the experts at RAND to say we are close enough that we think you should move on.

Commissioner Fazio asked in comparison to others for best practices, how are we doing? Chief Butler stated very well. The New York Fire Department is adopting a lot of new technology and has great ideas that we would like to share. It was resounding how many of those agencies are moving towards accreditation.

Commissioner Fazio stated when the public begins to ask questions as it relates to response time (i.e. the report put out by the Controller's Office), what would be the suggested way people can go about receiving information? Chief Butler stated the mission of the taskforce is to look at the data integrity, interpretation, performance measurements, integration, and implementation. In terms of reporting figures, that is a decision by Fire Chief Cummings.

Chief Cummings stated that all information requests would go through the Community Liaison Officer (CLO), and the goal is to eventually have that information available on LAFD.org

7. PUBLIC COMMENT PERIOD

Mr. Frank Lima, Vice President, UFLAC, commented there is good work occurring in the Labor-Management Committee. He welcomed Commissioner Fazio. He stated that in regard to the CAL JAC, it was shut down for a while because some of the policies were not being followed and we were doing it differently than the rest of the state. He stated in regard to data and response times or level of

service because we are cutting inspectors, he wanted to clarify that UFLAC is definitely against all cuts to the Fire Prevention Bureau inspectors, especially the self-funded. There are inspectors working with tremendously deteriorated working conditions. There are several hundred, if not thousands of brush inspections that are not getting done. When you borrow inspectors to get one thing done, things pile up [elsewhere]; the level of service is not there.

8. ITEMS REQUIRING PUBLIC HEARING

- A. [BFC 12-138] – Proposal to charge Fees for Fire Life Safety Inspection of Industrial and Commercial Buildings - proposed fee:
1. Approve the proposed Industrial and Commercial Inspection Fee of \$440 per Building (two and a half hours at the proposed Inspector Hourly Rate of \$176 per hour.
 2. Subject to the approval of the City Council and Mayor, request the City Council to instruct the City Attorney to draft revisions to the Los Angeles Municipal Code (L.A.M.C.), Chapter 5, Article 7, to create an Industrial and Commercial Fire Life Safety Section including provisions for the collection of fees and for the regular review and modification of the fees based on verifiable costs to the City.
(Please refer to report for complete details.)

Discussion was held regarding if monies collected from these inspections could be kept by the Fire Department and the two current vacancies in the Fire Life Safety Inspection of Industrial and Commercial Buildings.

MOTION (Friedman/Skobin): That the Board directs the Commission Executive Assistant to schedule a Board of Fire Commissioners public hearing and publish the required notices relative to the proposed fee enactment.

ADOPTED: AYES – 4

MOTION (Skobin/Friedman): That the Board rescinds the prior vote on 1.A., and there being no requests from members of the public to speak, that the Board approve Item 1.A. as amended, that the report with a change to verbiage on Recommendation 1. Add “with four hour minimum. Reference 57.01.32.”.

ADOPTED: AYES – 4 (Absent: Tolentino)

9. IDENTIFICATION OF THE BOARD’S MEET AND CONFER NEGOTIATORS REGARDING DISCIPLINARY GUIDELINES

Fire Chief Cummings identified Battalion Chief Richard Rideout.

10. CLOSED SESSION

- A. Conference with negotiators pursuant to Government Code Section 54957.6(a) – To permit the Board to review its negotiating position and instruct its negotiators concerning the conduct of negotiations regarding disciplinary guidelines.
- B. Public Employee Performance Evaluation. Discuss and possible Board action on annual evaluation. Government Code Section 54957.
1. Fire Chief
- C. Conference with Legal Counsel pursuant to Government Code Section 54956.9(a) – To discuss pending litigation of the following cases:

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, SEPTEMBER 4, 2012

DRAFT

Miller & Rueda v. City of Los Angeles – Case No. BC 416479
Brenda Lee v. City of Los Angeles – Case No. BC336783, B202865

The regular meeting recessed and the Board went into closed session.

Assistant City Attorney De La Guerra called the regular meeting to order and stated Item 10.A. was not discussed as it was previously referred to the Personnel Committee. Item 10.B. was continued to a later date and was not discussed. Item 10.C. will be continued.

11. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting was adjourned.

ATTEST BY:

GENETHIA HUDLEY-HAYES
President

LETICIA GOMEZ
Commission Executive Assistant II

Date: January 17, 2013

Note: Actions of the Board shall become final at the expiration of the next five meeting days of the City Council during which the Council has convened in regular session, unless the Council acts within that time by two-thirds vote to bring the action before it or to waive review of the action.