

CITY OF LOS ANGELES
BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, APRIL 17, 2012

DRAFT

The Regular Meeting of the Board of Fire Commissioners convened at 9:05 a.m. in the Fire Commission Meeting Room, City Hall East, 200 N. Main Street, Room 1820, Los Angeles.

▪ **ROLL CALL**

Present: President Genethia Hudley-Hayes
Vice President Casimiro Tolentino
Commissioner Andrew Friedman
Fire Chief Brian L. Cummings
Deputy City Attorney Janet Jackson

Absent: Commissioner Jill Furillo

▪ **FLAG SALUTE AND MOMENT OF SILENCE**

The flag salute was followed by a moment of silence in honor of past and present members of the Los Angeles Fire Department, the Fire Service, Law Enforcement, EMS and the Military who devote their lives to the protection of the community and of our Country.

President Hudley-Hayes requested, with the permission of the Board and Fire Chief Cummings, she would like to deviate from the agenda and take Item 4.A. first because Fire Chief Cummings has to be in City Council for a presentation this morning. She clarified that general Public Comment would be taken prior to Item 4.A.

1. **PUBLIC COMMENT**

None.

4. **OLD BUSINESS – Taken out of turn.**

A. [BFC 12-061] – Response Time Analysis Report

Recommendation: That the Board provides instruction to staff and adopts any necessary action relative to the reporting of response time performance data and dispatch issues.

Battalion Chief Trevor Richmond stated in order to simplify the report he would like to give some context to how the Department analyzed response times and how that analysis was used in the decision making process. The basic intent behind the NFPA was, it is a consensus body that comes together to develop guidance for fire departments on objectives or goals they should be aiming for. The intent of the NFPA is to establish a collaborative dialogue between the community and the fire service so that the community can have input into what a particular fire department does and how they deploy their resources. Specifically with regard to NFPA Guidance 1221 and 1710, NFPA 1221 looks at call-processing time. That is the point that the call comes into the Fire Department to the point we send the dispatch to the Fire Station. 1221 has a standard that they aim for and it is to do that in less than one minute 95% of the time. The other standard we looked at was NFPA 1710, and we wanted to focus on this standard because it deals primarily with when the dispatch comes into the Fire Station to the point when the resource pushes “on-scene” – that is your response time.

Battalion Chief Richmond stated the reason we focused on 1710 is the resource reductions were going to have impact there; they were not necessarily going to have impact on NFPA 1221 because there were not any reductions in the Metro Fire Dispatch Center. Therefore, they did not expect to see any impact there, however, they did expect to see some impact and some change in NFPA 1710.

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, APRIL 17, 2012

DRAFT

Commissioner Friedman asked for clarification, is this the time from which the call is received by the Fire Station until the time that the unit rolls out? Battalion Chief Richmond stated no, when the unit presses “on-scene” at the incident. Commissioner Friedman clarified – when they arrive at the incident. Battalion Chief Richmond agreed.

Battalion Chief Richmond stated that in regard to the Deccan software, the Apparatus Deployment Analysis Module (ADAM) purchased by the Fire Department assisted in the decision-making process as we looked for ways to more efficiently deploy resources. Deccan software consists of three components; the first is the CAD Analyst which is basically a big organizer. It allows us to separate types of incidents and look at a specific layer or metric, i.e., structure fires or EMS calls, and it allows us to measure performance. ADAM on the other hand is a “what if” scenario, it is more descriptive. We could ask ADAM if we pulled out so many numbers of resources, what the impact would be considering that everything remain in its present location, and ADAM would tell us what that projection would look like based on historical call data. The third layer of the Deccan software is Optimizer which is more prescriptive, i.e., if we had 40 aerial ladder trucks in the City what would be the optimum location for those trucks? We can ask the computer to do that for us. When we were using the Deccan software, we primarily focused on the CAD Analyst and the Apparatus Deployment Analysis Module. We used Optimizer frequently, but we were not adding resources necessarily so it was not a particular part of the software that we were going to get a lot of use out of; we used it infrequently.

Vice President Tolentino reconfirmed that the Optimizer tells them where to place the resources. Battalion Chief Richmond agreed. Vice President Tolentino stated if they did not use the Optimizer, what did they use? Battalion Chief Richmond responded ADAM and an interesting anecdote with the Optimizer is when we first got the software, just learning how to use it, and we asked what should our fire department look like, are fire station locations correct, and are resources correct? And they almost hit it right on the mark; it verified what we already knew. For some of the busier fire stations we asked what should be in that fire station and Optimizer does not take into account the size of the fire station. It just takes into account the call loads and the type of calls and will make a recommendation based on that, and at Fire Station 9 it put in 5 rescue ambulances, 4 fire engines, but we knew that fire station could not hold that many apparatus, but it verified for them knowing the call load at Fire Station 9 that would probably be the most important footprint there.

Battalion Chief Richmond stated in regard to modeled data, when we were asked by the City Council to come up with a deployment plan; they had to look into the future and had to create a hypothetical. The only thing we could use for that hypothetical was historical call data. When we took the historical call data and put it into the ADAM software, ADAM made a projection on what our deployment would look like and how our response times would be affected if we were to reduce our resources. It is modeled data and the key thing to point out is when you model data there are variances that go into the backend of that model and you cannot account for all of them. Mr. Jeff Godown will speak to this in regard to variances and accuracy.

Battalion Chief Richmond stated what we found was the impact, regardless of the percentages; the impact is what we were really focusing on. What was the measured impact of reduction of resources, and what we have seen based on the modeled data, and the real data we are looking at now because we have about eight months of real data in the computer and it hit right on target. The projections were fairly accurate.

President Hudley-Hayes commented one of the things that is important, and has been so confusing, is that there is still this belief that we were not using historical data. In fact, the

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, APRIL 17, 2012

DRAFT

confusion between the modeled data, what people are accusing, the accusatory thing is if you had data why didn't you use it? But what Battalion Chief Richmond is explaining, and making her more aware of it, is they did use historical data but you still had to make a projection because people cannot see into the future. It is critical that this be understood when the presentation is made. It may have been confusing, but numbers were not being just pulled out of nowhere, historical data was being input and that is where the projection came from.

Battalion Chief Richmond stated we are seeing that the modeled data showed higher percentages than the actual data and when we ran those comparisons it was important that we had similar comparisons. When we had a projection or a hypothetical that was modeled data, in order to compare that we needed to model the data over on this side as well, so we were comparing a like comparison, similar. That is an important piece to understand.

Battalion Chief Richmond stated where the response times come in is in a decision-making process. He noted the items reviewed in determining the deployment of resources. Call loads in a first-in district will have a significant impact on resource availability and simultaneous incidents occurring in a given district. We wanted to look at those call loads and in fact some of the deployment things they had done were undone from ADAM by call loads, i.e., ADAM had recommended we place a particular resource in a certain location and we went back and looked at the call loads and determined the call load is too high, we have to leave that resource. The other thing they looked at was Division 9 of the Fire Code has maximum response distances for engines and aerial apparatus; we made sure we looked at those. The National Incident Management System (NIMS) is a nondiscretionary guideline from the Federal Government that mandates command and control an incident, and what a Department must do and must have when they are running an incident in the City. We had to make sure we sustained that as well.

Battalion Chief Richmond stated in regard to topography, one thing the Optimizer and ADAM does not do well is it thinks the world is flat. We all know we have the Santa Monica Mountains, i.e., the Optimizer said we should put an aerial ladder truck on top of Mulholland. Maybe some day, but not now. There are a lot of tight roads up there and we know that from our experience. In regard to special hazards, they know in Battalion 6, Harbor area, we have a lot of refineries. They had to consider this as well, and ADAM and the Optimizer do not consider those variables.

Battalion Chief Richmond stated we have some letters of agreement with the Airport and the Harbor that we have to maintain a certain resource presence in those areas, which is non-negotiable. The experience of the Senior Command Staff, members in the Department for over 30 years that know the egress problems that exist, also played a part in the decision-making process. Ultimately, we looked at response time projections and we factored those in as well. In closing, response times were one factor we considered. There were multiple factors we looked at and then the Fire Chief decided where to place resources.

Battalion Chief Richmond introduced Mr. Jeff Godown, retired from LAPD, his resume is long and distinguished, and he was one of the primary implementers, facilitators, engineers of LAPD's COMPSTAT Program. The Mayor's Office asked Mr. Godown to work with the LAFD and analyze objectively, independently how we report response times, how we analyze data, and he has had a good opportunity for the last three weeks to do so. Mr. Godown speaks all over the world on this issue and he has a lot of experience in it.

Mr. Jeff Godown stated he would like to speak about his experience, what he was involved in the last couple of years and the COMPSTAT process with the LAPD, some of the issues and also some of the issues the LAFD has and what he has seen.

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, APRIL 17, 2012

DRAFT

Mr. Godown stated he had 28 years with the LAPD. In 2002, William Bratton implemented a process called COMPSTAT, which had been started prior to his arrival under Chief Bernard Parks and was called Fast Track. One of the issues observed is as we went to the data sources to start tracking data and reviewing data, the City data systems could not handle some of the questions asked, i.e., the CAD System, Crime Data Systems were not designed to pull that data out in a timely fashion and use it to analyze. One of the biggest issues (he was the Interim Chief for the San Francisco Police until last year) is that a public safety executive, both Police and Fire, the biggest issues they run into in 2012 is the old days of throwing as many resources to a problem as you can – you cannot do that any more. A Fire Chief or Police Chief has to come up with a business model on how to deploy his resources and provide the City with the quality service they desire and that they deserve, and in some instances there will be a lot of people that won't necessarily agree with how you deploy those resources, but you have to have a process in which you can employ those resources. San Francisco had the same issues.

Mr. Godown stated the Fire Chief and he and the Mayor have also discussed when he went up to San Francisco to come down and look at a FIRESTAT/COMPSTAT-type process. To be able to take all the existing data and utilize it to be much smarter on how you run your Police Department. They are using it in private industry; most Police Departments across the country use it. The main source of information is the Computer Automated Dispatch data (CAD), the 9-1-1 calls that come in. In doing his research here, he found it interesting is that we talk about NFPA standards. The bottom line is, he is assuming, that citizens of the City, all they care is when they dial 9-1-1, when the fire truck and paramedic get there. They do not care about the percentage. When he initially looked at the CAD system, he still has more questions as to the timeliness of the CAD system. They are doing a biopsy from the time the call comes in, when the time goes to the Police Department, to the first response by the Fire Department – we are looking at all those data sets to make sure it is timely and accurate. The Fire Department data-wise is LAPD 2002 – they ran into the same problems when they looked at the data and realized that they might have to tweak and adjust the data. The Fire Chief and he have discussed it, and are in agreement that there is no attempt by this Fire Department, anybody in this Department, to falsify the numbers, lie, and deceive the Board, City Council or the community. He does believe the Department could have done a better job with their presentation. He has read all the reports; it becomes very confusing between modeling and real data.

Mr. Godown stated he is also working with Deccan to get behind the computer and look at the variances and variables used as far as the modeling is concerned and the real-time data. He has discussed with the Fire Chief regarding slowly moving away from the percentages. How many minutes does it take to get to a citizen here when they dial 9-1-1. The NFPA standard is a great standard to use to measure your effectiveness as far as the call waiting, call load, putting turnout gear on and responding, but the reality is the citizen wants to know how long it takes to go from point A to point B. The confusion is when you start looking at the modeling with the percentages and the actual seconds it takes to get here. His plan is to do a complete biopsy of the CAD data, look at the Deccan system, and look how they are querying the system. The misconception outside this building, amongst City Council as well as citizens, is the Fire Chief has leveraged all the deployment and stuck it in one computer and pushed a button, and the Deccan is one tool of many other tools that the Fire Chief used for deployment. The reality is that up until 2009, the Deccan system did not occur and they seemed to deploy pretty well prior to this computer. He has seen many other factors come into play to deploy these resources and Deccan is not the savior as far as deployment is concerned.

President Hudley-Hayes commented that for people that use technology and understand technology, Deccan is something that is used by a variety of fire services nationally, correct?

Mr. Godown stated yes. President Hudley-Hayes asked if there are some things about Deccan that now have to be looked at and have to be tweaked in order to make it more reliable, as just the one thing the Fire Chief would look at here in Los Angeles. For technology and software you tend to get a standard package because it is covering a lot of different variables. It is important that people outside of this building and in City Council understand that it is one variable used, but there are also software items that need to be tweaked.

Mr. Godown agreed and stated he would be meeting with the software builders and get behind and look at the different variances and variables in the system. The LAFD, this is their first cut as far as using technology is concerned – again, it is the same as LAPD 2002. LAFD does not have the experience in data crunching and data analysis. In the Police Department, they do not have a choice because they have UCR guidelines that they have to report crime back to the FBI. They have been in that business for many years, and they still ran into issues where they had to tweak and put out special notices to make sure there is no human error in the processing of the system. He emphasized that the software is not the savior to deployment.

Vice President Tolentino asked if there is any other comparable software to Deccan. Mr. Godown stated there are others out there, but he has not looked at any other software packages. He has been e-mailed, through the Mayor's Office, by 3-4 different vendors back east which he has never met, but the Deccan seems to be a pretty robust system. We need to get in there and adjust it, look at it and get to the back-end to see what the variables are. It does not make a difference what the computer says because the reality is what goes on outside these walls, in the City, is a completely different situation, i.e., you would be hard-pressed to get a fire truck through Hollywood and Highland at 5:00 p.m. on a Friday.

Fire Chief Brian Cummings stated regarding the question of different software, there are different modeling software. The IAFF has a deployment modeling software that they use for different departments. Deccan is used by over 100 fire departments in the United States, and a decision was made by the Mayor's Office, some time ago, to purchase this software after reviewing the different software models available. Again, it was just one tool and as LAFD started to use it in November 2009; we validated the information coming out. We came up with the scenarios based on all the factors Battalion Chief Richmond stated and the scenarios were put into the Deccan software, and when results were obtained we went back and tallied by hand. LAFD reviewed the assumptions obtained to validate that information prior to even using it more extensively.

Fire Chief Cummings stated they modeled hundreds of scenarios in developing the Deployment Plan, and felt fairly confident in the information it was giving us as far as the impact that those scenarios would have on response times.

Commissioner Friedman asked if dispatch processing was separated from response after the call is received by LAFD. Mr. Godown stated yes, with the CAD we can pull a printout of the actual time for the time the call comes into LAFD, how long they hold it, when they queue it, when they send it to a station, how long it takes the station to acknowledge, when they respond, and how long they have been to the scene. The one component that we do not look at, that we are working to look at, is the LAPD piece. There are a lot of people that do not realize the LAPD picks up that phone first. How long does the Department have that call, how long it takes them to queue back into the LAFD section – we do not have the timestamp on that, we will acquire that from the Department, but through the Fire management/accountability FIRESTAT component we will look at the backend, i.e., how long an ambulance is at the scene, how long they stay at the hospital. The data allows us to start looking at the operational necessities and really take a good look at how we can get more resources back in the field in a timely fashion.

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, APRIL 17, 2012

DRAFT

Is there a problem in communications with dispatching the call, do the ambulances spend too much time at L.A. County on a Friday night? All those things we will look at because we have that data to look at, and then we will move forward with other data sets to allow the Fire Chief to make conscious decisions on how to run the Department.

Commissioner Friedman stated he raised this today and also last time – Fire Chief Cummings when you make your presentation to Council, he would hope that the Fire Chief will indicate to Council that this is an ingredient that is completely beyond the control of the Fire Department. His recollection from last time was that this could be anywhere from 1.5 minutes and up.

Fire Chief Cummings agreed and stated he would be sure to present that to Council because the time from when the call is actually made to the time we get on scene is the actual full response time.

Commissioner Friedman stated when you are talking about five minutes or six minutes, that is not the actual time that the citizen/person that receives the service gets because it is our five or six minutes plus the time which we have absolutely no control over.

Mr. Godown reiterated when a person dials 9-1-1, it is from the time they dial 9-1-1 to when that truck or ambulance arrives. They do not care that it is broken up in segments, they do not care how long it takes you to put your equipment on, and they want you there as fast as possible. Commissioner Friedman stated that is exactly my point, yet a good part of that is beyond the control of the Fire Department. Mr. Godown stated correct, when the LAFD dispatcher receives that call they have no idea how long the Police Department has been on the line. Fire Chief Cummings agreed.

President Hudley-Hayes agreed that the citizen does not care and the Commissioners present believe it is important that there is a time where there is a transfer that happens. So if it is a busy night for 9-1-1 that could add 90 seconds, and that is another variable that does not get factored in. That is another piece of the puzzle when trying to unpack this in the way that is most transparent and understandable for the general public. It is another item for them to be aware of.

Mr. Godown stated he is aware we are working closely with the Controller's Office and that they are working on an audit, but some of the information, i.e., CAD data, has certain time stamps on it – time dispatched, time at scene – some of the time at scene stamps are missing, and there is a reason why it is missing but that has to be explained. It is getting out to the public, to Council and the Commission and explaining the different variables of the data. They had the same problems in the Police Department, some they had to tweak, some to readjust. They had to put policies and procedures in place for the human factor. All those things are going to be looked at and he will be coming back with a report for the Fire Chief in the near future as to the CAD system, the Deccan system and is there anything we need to do as far as the data analysis, is there a human issue, and all those things. We will come back to the table with a report for the Commission.

Vice President Tolentino asked what the near future is. Mr. Godown stated it appears the Controller's Office has about six full-time people doing this and the Fire Chief has one full-time person doing this. They gave you 90 days for a report and I believe it would be premature to come out with a report without having their report at the same time. We look forward to the report, the Fire Chief and he, and if there is anything in the report that needs to be fixed we will fix it. If there are any suggestions, we will look at them, but I can probably come out with something in probably the next 30 days. I do not think that there is anything that I have

discussed at the podium today that is going to be any different than what I am going to give you in a report. I do not see any huge issues, it is just a matter of everybody understanding that Deccan is not the savior for deployment in this City; it is one small tool in the toolbox. The presentation of ADAM software vs. real-time data became very confusing because the Fire Department is not in the data mining business. One of the issues Fire Chief is going to bring up to City Council is you can not have a part-time employee come in and crunch numbers for 90 days and put them back out in the field. You need consistent people working. One of the things done in this City, as in San Francisco, budget cuts mean civilian employees gone. Because they want to see Police and Fire, the work that the Police and Fire do sometimes causes more work on the backend where civilian employees have to come in and take over that. But a consistent data analysis, a group of people the Fire Chief can have on a daily basis to help him with that, and we will move further on past just the Deccan software as time goes on.

Public Comment

Mr. Pat McOsker, UFLAC President, commented the two successive speakers which came to the microphone spoke about NFPA 1710 - it was different, but fairly dismissive of it, as a goal, as something more esoteric. Mr. McOsker stated he is on the 1710 Committee, a national standard writing committee for the fire service. It is an industry organization, NFPA, National Fire Protection Association. The reason it is not the law, just a national standard, is because they do not tend in local government to impose laws on ourselves, just on others, but other national standards like the Uniform Building Code for instance does become the law because local government does not mind imposing those laws on builders. We should actually adopt it as what we are going to do, what we are going to provide, but in the meantime it is a standard that is based on minimum safety. It is a standard that allows the Fire Department and the community to know whether or not you can respond to and put out the basic 2,000 sq. ft. single-family dwelling fire, with fire in one room, get there on time with enough people and the right resources, and we are not even meeting that. That is what this discussion should be about, 40% of the time we do not get there on time to save a life, if someone is not breathing, if someone is choking on a chunk of meat, if somebody needs a hole cut in a roof so they can breath fresh air long enough until the firefighters get in there. We are not getting there on time to save lives. I am tired of all this defense, I am skeptical of any more Mayoral appointees telling us how we should do it. The whole thing about running down 1710 seems to be "never mind that, just trust us, we will tell you what the right configuration of the Fire Department ought to be." Well I do not, I know that that standard is based on sound science and data and hundreds of years of experience. I am one of just a few firefighters on that, it is actually dominated by people like our Mayor who want to "dumb down" fire and paramedic protection and run this fire department on the cheap. Yet even they agree with the sound science in the document, in the standard. I am looking forward to this Fire Department, or Administration, eventually joining with us to fight for the resources that we need to save lives in Los Angeles, instead of the other side of that issue.

Fire Chief Cummings stated there were four points he wanted to make on the presentation. One was the staffing issue that Mr. Godown mentioned; we do need that civilian support staff in order to do that data analysis. The second is that I did not do a good job of clearly identifying what were projections as we presented the plan, moving it forward, that it was projections that were used, which caused the confusion and confusing the projections with the actual numbers. Resources are the other piece. In that Deployment Plan we put forward, we said we would be reporting back to City Council after we looked at the actual numbers and requesting additional resources. We are coming back to Council requesting those resources now. Finding some ways that we can start addressing those gaps that we have identified, and the final piece is NFPA 1710. We have adopted that in the Fire Department as our goal. I, as a Fire Chief and this organization, support NFPA 1710. If anything that was said, if this Board took it as if we

were making light of 1710, please do not. It is a good standard and we are using it as a goal for this Department.

Vice President Tolentino stated he did not see it as making light of it actually. President Hudley-Hayes stated that is not the impression that I had. I understand everybody has different perceptions about what is happening, but that is not the impression I had. The impression I got from the presentation is that 1710 is important, but there are also other things that go into making a decision for a discreet city which is Los Angeles, 446 sq. miles, with a different geographical makeup, with different topography, and I did not feel 1710 was being denigrated. I think that we were being given the difference between 1710 and 1221, which we did not have before. I think the presentation was so that the Commission could begin to understand the differences too. Because even though we are the head of the department, we are civilians. We are like every other citizen in the City of Los Angeles and I want to take the responsibility of saying I was confused and am much less confused than I was before.

Vice President Tolentino stated he reviewed the report and presentation, and commented to Mr. McOsker that he did not get that impression at all. He thought that was one of the guidelines that they would be using and thought the report said this is the guideline the LAFD is striving to reach.

Battalion Chief Richmond stated we have had some conference calls with members of the NFPA, good discussions on resource deployment and how the NFPA is there is help us with the Fire Department.

President Hudley-Hayes stated that she understands UFLAC's concern because we are looking at this in a clearly objective way. What we want to make sure of is, from the Commission's perspective, in terms of this presentation, we did not hear any insulting or negating of that, but also I want to acknowledge that this is not the forum to have those kinds of conversations.

President Hudley-Hayes addressed Fire Chief Cummings. I heard you say that you do think that you need more resources. Can you tell us why?

Fire Chief Cummings stated as we look at the call load and the frequency of our resources out in the City, we can see that with our current deployment we are thin on resources. Particularly during the afternoon rush hour traffic, Monday through Friday, 2:00 p.m. to 7:00 p.m., where we have a high confluence of incidents. We get one third of our calls between those five hours. We have extended hospital wait times as our ambulances transport patients to hospitals. There is no bed availability so we have rescue ambulances that are tied up in hospitals. Traffic hospital wait time and high numbers of incidents, and the traffic is the other piece. It is difficult to get anywhere in the City of Los Angeles between 2:00 p.m. and 7:00 p.m. It is the same for our fire apparatus that are responding. With those three components, that is when it is most difficult for us for company availability and our response times are extended. By staffing some additional variably staffed ambulances, 10-hour ambulances, during that peak call-load period we can start addressing some of those issues. Further things we need to work on is that detailed data analysis so we can make sure that we understand what the problem is, to look at those hospital wait time issues and see if there is another solution so we can make companies available, and then look for any other external factors that are affecting our company availability and our travel time. The NFPA standard states a four-minute travel time as a standard. In the City of Los Angeles, because of distance, topography, and traffic there are places that we can not drive to in four minutes. That has to be factored in as well and NFPA 1710 makes allowance for that.

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, APRIL 17, 2012

DRAFT

Vice President Tolentino commented that in Battalion Chief Richmond's decision-making process he listed a lot of guidelines including Command Staff. It seems to me we should also consider what the rank and file folks are thinking about as part of your decision-making process. That is important; they are the real-time, real-life experiences with regard to making those particular difficult decisions that you have to make.

Fire Chief Cummings stated that piece was weighed into the Deployment Plan. We requested feedback from our field resources. We asked through Deputy Chief Mario Rueda, Emergency Services Bureau, down through the Battalions and to the Stations. We asked for feedback on what resource configuration, what their workload and issues were, and that was factored in as well. Again, with the additional resources, with the adjustments we are making to the Deployment Plan on the 22nd, we did the same; we requested from the field their feedback of where they identified gaps, where they thought resources would be better, and their very subjective point of view from living it every day.

President Hudley-Hayes stated in addition to the request for additional resources, do you factor in the need for more civilian resources as well? We are now talking about people who can crunch numbers and you can have a staff, where you are not bringing in somebody for 90 days and then sending them away. We are talking about resources to make the Department effective and to make you have a good, strong business plan and your business is fire safety. Will you factor that in as well? I know that may not go down well with "boots on ground" but there are other things that go into running a fire service as large as the Los Angeles Fire Department.

Fire Chief Cummings stated absolutely. One of the points he has continually made is that if we do not have the critical civilian support staff to keep the apparatus running, to keep our IT systems up, to process and collect revenue for the Department, then we cannot sustain our ability to respond to those emergency responses, and our civilian workforce for the Fire Department has been severely impacted and they continue to be so. That is a critical piece as we move forward and one of the things we are requesting is to maintain and fill some of the vacant critical civilian support positions.

Commissioner Friedman stated perhaps in addition to filling vacant positions, and again I don't know whether this is an "untouchable," but the furlough issue. I know for a fact that our executive secretary puts in extra hours and is off because of the furloughs a number of days, and I think perhaps before filling new positions, if the experienced people could at least...we could save some of that furlough and they could work instead of the number of days they work currently an additional few days then perhaps we would be gaining more productive work.

Fire Chief Cummings stated absolutely, if we could end the furloughs. Again, reduced staff and then staff furloughed, our civilians are doing an amazing job with far less – over 25% less people. They are back down to their 1999 staffing levels in a city that has grown considerably over the last 20 years.

President Hudley-Hayes thanked Battalion Chief Richmond and Mr. Godown for the presentation. She added that this report and presentation cleared up a lot of the confusion for her. She too was confused about the use of historical data and now she understands it was used and was the basis for making these projections. And you can't make a projection on any kind of data because you do not have the data to project on. This was a more complete report and it took care of some of the questions that the Commission has, and as we work with and get information from Mr. Godown we will have more questions answered.

2. COMMISSION BUSINESS

- A. Announcements/Meetings/Events
Considered jointly with Items 3.A. and 3.B.

3. GENERAL MANAGER'S REPORT

- A. Announcements/Meetings/Events

Items 2.B., 3.A. and 3.B. considered jointly. Fire Chief Cummings referenced the events he attended since the last Commission meeting: two weeks ago he attended the Harvard Kennedy School for a Management of Crisis class. The class addresses a different way for managing large scale, landscape scale-type incidents. Recommends class for the rest of the Command Staff. Upcoming events: Wednesday, Thursday and Friday will be at the Los Angeles Area Fire Chiefs Annual Convention in Arrowhead; May 3-4 will be at the International Association of Fire Chiefs Core Competencies teaching a session for new Fire Chiefs; May 20-24 is the Metro Fire Chiefs Conference in Kentucky.

President Hudley-Hayes asked if he needed to bring any of those items forward to the Commission. Fire Chief Cummings stated yes, I will be bringing the Metro Fire Chiefs Conference forward to the Commission. President Hudley-Hayes commented to be sure that we get it ahead of time. Fire Chief Cummings agreed and also added the National Fallen Firefighters Memorial in Maryland on October 6-7. We will have a firefighter that will be put on the monument. He will be traveling back for that and bring that forward as well.

Fire Chief Cummings referenced the Calendar of Events provided, and highlighted the following events: April 19 – Holocaust Annual Youth Commemoration, April 22 – Holocaust Annual Remembrance Day, April 23-25 – MDA Fill the Boot, April 25 – Denim Day, Sexual Assault Awareness Day, May – Brush Clearance Campaign begins, notices will go out and start sending media advisories out so public is aware.

President Hudley-Hayes addressed Fire Chief Cummings – you did not talk about the event you attended on Friday which was a critical presentation on your part.

Battalion Chief Armando Hogan stated that April 21st is our Fire Station 21 grand opening. Commissioners received their invitations and he apologized the item was left off the Calendar of Events.

Fire Chief Cummings apologized, two events he left off. We had our strategic planning process, Envision Our LAFD Summit, and brought together 85 individuals. About 70% were Department members, firefighters through himself, but then we had members of other City departments, members from the community and members from business. They came together to discuss the Department's path over the next five years. Good meeting, on track to bring the draft of our strategic plan to the Commission in June.

Fire Chief Cummings stated that the event on this Friday was he spoke at the Urban Issues Forum. Dynamic forum with members of the community that come forward and asked questions, specifically on the response time issue and gave him the opportunity to clear up the confusion and to state what the numbers meant, what were the projections, what was the performance, and talk about where we go forward with the Department from here to make sure that we do have the resources to respond in a timely manner and provide public safety in the City of Los Angeles.

President Hudley-Hayes stated she joined Fire Chief Cummings on Friday at the Urban Issues Forum. It was a cold, rainy day and there were about 125 people in that audience to come to hear Fire Chief Cummings because of the concern. She thought that Fire Chief Cummings gave an excellent presentation. She shared with him afterwards that he said things in the presentation that she had not heard. It was very transparent. Under a great deal of pressure, he got a line of maybe 20 people and the questions were difficult. People were angry and Fire Chief Cummings was able to take all of that in, process it, and she thinks that was the beginning for the community. It was a diverse community, it certainly was in the African-American community, but in that audience there were diverse number of people in the audience. He was able to get the message out about people who live in older homes needing to have smoke detectors, which really calmed people down. She congratulated Fire Chief Cummings on his presentation on Friday and she is looking forward to his presentation at City Council today.

Fire Chief Cummings stated it was a good forum and great opportunity to get out in the community and answer questions, and get our preparedness message out to the community.

B. Calendar of Events
Considered jointly with Item 3.A.

C. Significant Incidents/Activities

1. [BFC 12-064] – Significant Incident Summary report for the period of March 26 through April 1, 2012.

Recommendation: Receive and file.

ACTION: RECEIVED AND FILED.

Deputy Chief Rueda reported on Opening Day for the Dodgers. It was a deployment day for LAFD, they deployed bike medics and our gator vehicles up there and it improves response times. Same deployment for CicLAvia, the bike event. Eleven injuries, bicyclists which took tumbles, but bike medics and our gators were out there ensuring a rapid response. Due to the rain on Friday and Saturday the Department activated Swift Water Deployment teams. On April 3 one of our firefighters experienced a cardiac event and happened to be on the fire truck and his co-workers immediately recessitated him. He was hospitalized for three days; hopefully, he will be back at work shortly. Lastly, a gasoline tanker fire occurred on the 134 and 5 Interchange on April 7 about 11:10 p.m. Had about a seven-minute response time, which is not unusual for a freeway event. Engine 56 arrived on scene, had pre-planned it, and got a water supply. We ended up with over 150 firefighters there, including resources from Glendale, and shut down both sides of that 5 and 134 Interchange. Because it was outstanding work by the firefighters, he wanted to point out they put that fire out in about 70 minutes and were able to dike about 3,000 gallons of unburned fuel. The difference between that fire that occurred, which they were able to do core samples and open up the next day, as opposed to what we saw on the 60 Fwy., where maybe the inability to put that fire out immediately resulted in a reconstruction of that bridge. We also saw the same type of fire on the 91 Fwy. that burned for several hours. This was a remarkable job by the firefighters on scene having pre-planned it, got there in a reasonable time, quickly established water supply, good command and control, and a good coordinated effort with other agencies that responded. Miraculously, there were no injuries.

D. Verbal report on the disposition of LAFD matters considered by or referred to City Council/Committees during the period of April 3 through April 17, 2012.

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, APRIL 17, 2012

DRAFT

Recommendation: That the Board provides instruction to staff and adopts any necessary action relative to the LAFD matters considered by or referred to City Council/Committee during the reporting period.

Assistant Chief John Vidovich reported on the following matters:

April 16, Budget & Finance Committee – Councilmember’s Koretz’s motion was heard relative to restoring Department service levels for the remainder of the 2011-12 fiscal year. We are to report back next week on a modification of his motion on the cost for the balance of this fiscal year to restore six V-staffed 10-hour ambulances and two engines or six 24-hour ambulances and two engines. We also informed the Committee the Department is committed to working with labor to develop a 3-5 year re-growth plan of Department resource restoration. Councilmember Rosendahl’s motion was heard relative to requesting the Los Angeles Fire Department to report on current apparatus repair backlogs, critical staffing and critical staffing needs at supply and maintenance. Assistant Chief Tony Varela presented an excellent overview and has been directed by Deputy Chief Roxanne Bercik to submit a written report to the Fire Commission.

Assistant Chief Vidovich stated that the Department has been asked to report back quarterly on the progress made filling vacancies at the Shops, the performance metrics that are directly related to staffing to ensure these positions are filled and making a difference in meeting our baseline repair needs, and also to report apparatus out-of-service rates and repair backlogs. This first report is due back to Budget and Finance Committee on or about July 1st.

Today at City Council Fire Chief Cummings will explain the response time data. The Department will report back on capabilities of technology, platforms currently being used by the Department, and an analysis of the solutions that would be necessary to meet our operational objectives. Mr. Godown will present an update of his review and analysis of the Los Angeles Fire Department’s emergency response time statistics thus far. The Department will also report back on the technology issues leading to the dispatch problems experienced recently at Metro Fire Communications. Deputy Mayor Eileen Decker will attend and be available to answer any questions regarding funding for repairs of the CAD and station alerting system.

Finally, the Department will provide a report relative to the potential implementation of Automatic Vehicle Location (AVL) technology for all fire and emergency resources.

President Hudley-Hayes inquired regarding the Koretz Motion, where he wants to bring it forward for a vote so that resources can be added back from now through June 30th. Are you going to include, are you working with his office to have any specificity about what resources you want returned? Because once you return resources, are you not going to have to integrate them into the Deployment Plan? She is asking because sometimes there is a rush to add resources back in and we cannot absorb them in a way that makes sense, which creates more of a problem. Is he open to have you or some of your staff talk to him so that some of that can get in the motion, i.e., the specificity of what you would like to have back?

Fire Chief Cummings stated yes, and that Chief Vidovich has been having extensive conversations with Councilman Koretz’s office and all the City Council, and our message is to let him, as a Fire Chief, determine what resources we redeploy and where we need them. Because if we do not have that critical civilian support staff to start out with, we are going to be unable to keep those vehicles running. We will report back on what he requested, but then we will include in that report what it is that we actually need moving forward. President Hudley-

Hayes asked Fire Chief Cummings to ensure he kept the Commission informed, Fire Chief Cummings stated he would.

5. NEW BUSINESS

- A. [BFC 12-058] – Status of Automatic Vehicle Location Implementation
Recommendation: Receive and file.
ACTION: RECEIVED AND FILED.

Battalion Chief Brian E. Schultz asked the Commission if they would like to ask questions about the status or have him go over the report in total. President Hudley-Hayes responded she preferred that he go over it and does have questions.

Battalion Chief Schultz stated we have been looking at Automatic Vehicle Location (AVL) technology for at least the last 6-7 years. There are a number of challenges we faced along the way, obviously funding being one of them. We received, through the Mayor's Office, a grant or funding in the amount of \$400,000 to do a Tactical Information Program (TIP) pilot project to determine the feasibility of using AVL data for doing dispatch. AVL data is used by a lot of private companies, i.e. trucking firms; UPS, travel speeds, and do automatic routing with those vehicles and rerouting through the software packages.

Battalion Chief Schultz stated finding out where our vehicles are on a map is not working, the challenge exists for us. Actually using live AVL data, the actual location of the data, to build assignments to send on a dispatch is where the challenge comes for us. That involves a great deal more than just buying hardware, GPS receivers and computers that are laid out in this report. It actually involves a new mapping system and a new CAD system. Those are actual major components that in order to make a successful AVL program where we actually use AVL data to dispatch with, those items need to be addressed as well.

Battalion Chief Schultz stated we have purchased a number of units, installed them in various apparatus and we have quite a few computers that we still need to install. About 150 new mobile data computers that would need to be installed in vehicles to be able to just get the mapping and route-based response stuff into the vehicles. The rest of this involves things that are not in the report, i.e., new servers to handle the AVL system, new mapping system that is GIS compliant. Our CAD mapping system is not GIS based and integrating live AVL decision-making process into CAD is also a major portion. We are on our way. We do need additional funding, a significant amount of money to be able to make this happen. Just the hardware cost for each vehicle alone is in the neighborhood of \$6,000-\$7,000, and the total for just all of the laptops that we would need is \$5.2 million, and hiring hall installation for installing all that equipment. The grand total for what we are looking at for all of the additional units we need to put AVL capability in each of our apparatuses is about \$7.7 million.

President Hudley-Hayes commented that the TIP is something that LAFD started. Battalion Chief Schultz stated correct. President Hudley-Hayes added and that is a group that is heading this pilot project. Battalion Chief Schultz clarified that the TIP program came out of a HazMat program. We had a HazMat program, a group named ADASHI, who is mentioned in this report, is a private company and they helped us do modeling for plume modeling and a number of things regarding HazMat. So they ended up becoming the company of choice, we had a vehicle through which to access them and utilize them to assist us with AVL. ADASHI transformed from a role in the HazMat realm to their role as an AVL provider for us, or at least helping us get to AVL. That TIP program was tactical information so we know where all our resources are; know

where they are deployed at any given time. Believe LAPD uses a similar system called Red Team/Blue Team so they know where their resources are deployed.

President Hudley-Hayes asked why is that important for Commissioners to know, does that mean if you can see where it is you can reroute it if you need to because it is on a digital map and it can see bottlenecks of traffic?

Battalion Chief Schultz responded if you have a vehicle that has a GPS system now you can ask how I get from point A to point B. It will give you a route and that route can be based on a number of factors. You can ask it to take the shortest route, to take the fastest route. You can say I do not want to take these routes during this particular time of day. That is one aspect of routing. What we anticipate the system would do is when a dispatch is made to a fire engine, ambulance, one of our resources; it would have two points on the map. The point they have to respond to and their current location, and then it would give a suggested route on that map. Ultimately, it would be nice to have turn-by-turn instructions, like in some newer vehicles and also have the capability of recalculating if you make a wrong turn or make a choice not to take the route recommended. That is one aspect of it. That is in-vehicle and all that takes place in the vehicle. The actual decision-making process that would have to done by CAD is such that all of our dispatches are based on fire station location for the most part and a vehicle is assumed to be at a fire station - a fire station located in the center of their response area. When a call comes in at a given location, our CAD system goes out and looks at the available units and decides which are closest based on fire station locations. What live AVL data would do, in the CAD system, is not pick where the fire stations are but where they are really truly located. The concept is that we would actually be able to take the true location of the vehicle.

Vice President Tolentino asked as this is all to be completed in eight months, where are we going to get the \$7.7 million?

Fire Chief Cummings responded we are currently working with the Mayor's Office, they have identified MICLA funds, and we are moving forward with the AVL project with the Station Alerting System and with the Computer Aided Dispatch RFP. All three are moving forward and they have identified the funding in the MICLA.

President Hudley-Hayes asked because we have used the \$400,000, we now have to wait until we get more funding in and how long do we think that is going to take? Fire Chief Cummings stated he was not sure on the timelines, but they are moving forward with the RFP for station alerting right now, hopefully, starting next fiscal year to move forward with AVL.

Vice President Tolentino asked that the Commission be kept updated and in three months inform the Commission of the status. Battalion Chief Shultz agreed.

6. NEW BUSINESS – CONSENT ITEMS

President Hudley-Hayes called special 6.A., B., and C.

- A. [BFC 12-056] – Approval of the Draft Paramedic Educational Services Agreement with the University of California, for Pre-Hospital Care
Recommendation: That the Board approves the report and recommendations.
ACTION: APPROVED WITH CORRECTIONS.

- B. [BFC 12-057] – 2012 Brush Clearance Appeals Process and Appointment of the Hearing Officers. Approval to hire the following hearing officers to conduct appeals on behalf of the Board of Fire Commissioners: 1) Kelly O’Brien, 2) Adam Kretzmar and 3) Ako B. Eluma.
Recommendation: That the Board approves the report and recommendations.
ACTION: APPROVED.
- C. [BFC 12-060] - In-Kind Donation for Portable Generator Connection
Recommendation: That the Board approves the report and recommendations.
ACTION: APPROVED WITH CORRECTIONS.
- D. [BFC 12-062] – Monthly Disciplinary Action Summary – January 2012
Recommendation: Receive and file.
ACTION: RECEIVED AND FILED.
- E. [BFC 12-063] – Monthly Disciplinary Action Summary – February 2012
Recommendation: Receive and file.
ACTION: RECEIVED AND FILED.
- F. [BFC 12-065] - Corrective Action Summary – Notice of Discharge, Suspension, or Probationary Termination reports filed with the Board of Fire Commissioners – March 20 through April 3, 2012.
Recommendation: Receive and file.
ACTION: RECEIVED AND FILED.

MOTION (Friedman/Tolentino): That the Board receive and file 6.D., E., and F.
ADOPTED: AYES – 3 (Absent: Furillo)

7. ITEMS CALLED SPECIAL

- A. [BFC 12-056] – Approval of the Draft Paramedic Educational Services Agreement with the University of California, for Pre-Hospital Care
Recommendation: That the Board approves the report and recommendations.
ACTION: APPROVED WITH CORRECTIONS.

Mr. Bill Jones, Senior Management Analyst II, stated this is a contract LAFD has had with UCLA for a number of years. The agreement has been sent through the City Attorney’s Office for legal review, UCLA has also reviewed it and they are agreeable to the terms. There is one correction on the Recommendations. The Account Number by which the program/contract is funded is inaccurate, the Account Number should read Fund 40J, Account 3840JB.

President Hudley-Hayes asked how does this work? UCLA sets aside a certain number of lots? Mr. Jones responded they have arranged and will set aside a certain number of slots; we will validate those slots ahead of the class beginning. Any slots that remain open, they will extend to other students that are eligible for the program.

President Hudley-Hayes asked if she was looking at the fact that this is a cost of \$3.1 million as indicated in the Summary. Who pays that? Mr. Jones stated yes, the Fire Department does. President Hudley-Hayes asked what it means when it says “enrolling and reserving space for LAFD students?” Who are those people? Mr. Jones stated they would be our firefighters that are looking to certify themselves as paramedics in the program. They are generally the single-function firefighter that is looking to expand their horizons and get the education as a full-fledged paramedic as opposed to their EMT certification.

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, APRIL 17, 2012

DRAFT

President Hudley-Hayes commented and the screening examinations, those are carried out by UCLA or do we also have someone who helps with the screening?

Deputy Chief Bercik stated Captain Thomas Stafford would come up and answer the question.

Vice President Tolentino asked who are the LAFD Cadets? They are candidates for employment, so they are not currently our employees?

Fire Chief Cummings stated correct, our Cadet Program is our Youth Volunteer Program; it was the former Explorer Program. When we have additional spots...we train a certain amount of firefighters as paramedics so that we can renew our pool of paramedics and expand our paramedic resources. If we have slots that we do not use, there are criteria for offering those opportunities to attend paramedic school to members of our Cadet Program. They have selection criteria for whom get an opportunity to be selected and then we sponsor them to go to paramedic school. Again, we are looking at those cadets as a pool of people that we will be trying to hire as we groom them into becoming firefighters.

Vice President Tolentino stated they are not currently employees, so why are we paying their tuition? Fire Chief Cummings responded it is part of our program, it is an opportunity to extend paramedic training to some individuals, young cadets that may not have had the opportunity to pay to go to paramedic school and these are cadets that with their skill set we feel that they have a high probability of us hiring them.

Captain Stafford clarified it is actually a mentoring program; the cadets actually pay for their own training at the paramedic schools. The fiscal responsibility is not our burden at the Fire Department, it is on the cadets. President Hudley-Hayes stated the \$3.1 million does not extend to those. Captain Stafford stated it does not apply to the Cadet Program.

Vice President Tolentino referenced Exhibit A, January 2012, how many cadets and how many students are involved? Captain Stafford stated currently, we have 15 LAFD members who are about to graduate from the Paramedic Program. Typically, we try to send about three classes per year of LAFD members. Those classes consist of approximately 15 members who go through the program. The cost of the school, the cost of the salaries of the members attending school, as well as the hiring behind those members who are in positions before also are expenses that are covered in the program.

President Hudley-Hayes asked why we sole source this to UCLA? Captain Stafford stated through our experiences with the various different agencies we found that Daniel Freeman was the most conducive for success of our members. They actually were dedicated with hiring our staff back at times, even over the weekends to help do remediation and provide a quality program that would help with success. There is a lot of money that is obviously invested in each Department member going through the program. We want to ensure success and he proudly said that in their last class, all 15 LAFD members who started have successfully completed the program.

Vice President Tolentino inquired regarding the last page of the report, Exhibit F – Slavery Disclosure Ordinance, signed in December 2007. Deputy City Attorney Janet Jackson responded it was part of the standard terms and conditions that are required as part of our agreement.

President Hudley-Hayes asked what does that mean. Mr. Jones stated that the City Council imposed a number of years ago, an ordinance that requires the identification of organizations

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, APRIL 17, 2012

DRAFT

that have either been in existence since the mid-1800s or have benefited from the growth of such an organization, and have materialized into a future organization. It is a standard requirement that the companies are required to report to the City. It is simply a notification that they were using to track at that time. In the case of UCLA, it has been around since the 1800s...actually from the early 1900s. Vice President Tolentino stated since 1921. Mr. Jones stated it is a requirement for all companies to report this and it is simply enforcement. UCLA had asked that this be included as part of the agreement and the City Attorney's Office agreed that we would make it a formal document, portion of this document.

Vice President Tolentino asked has anyone ever been denied an exemption? Mr. Jones stated to the best of my knowledge, no. Vice President Tolentino commented it seems so out of touch with the world. He asked Deputy City Attorney Jackson if the item was fine as to form. Deputy City Attorney Jackson stated yes and noted Anthony-Paul Diaz is the attorney that reviewed this item. He is one of the attorneys in our Contracts Division.

President Hudley-Hayes asked if this was a self-selection process, how we make sure that it is fair and equitable for everybody who wants to do this. Captain Stafford stated absolutely, we send an Information Notice out Department-wide for all members who are interested in applying and going through the process of qualification. We conduct a standard examination that is used throughout the country called the HOBET, and that test comprises of several categories: math, reading comprehension, emergency medical technician knowledge and science. From the results of that test members are placed on a list in order of their success in the examination process by score, and then they are selected based on that success. President Hudley-Hayes reiterated the process.

Captain Stafford stated correct. He added that there is an agreement that we have with the union as well on how we do the selection process. They have agreed and signed off on it as well. President Hudley-Hayes stated UFLAC has signed off on the way in which this screening process takes place? Captain Stafford stated yes. President Hudley-Hayes stated we do not get any pushback from our employee organizations, i.e., Los Bomberos, Stentorians, or Women in Fire Service? We make sure that everybody is comfortable with this. Captain Stafford stated there is great representation across the board of different ethnicities.

Vice President Tolentino asked do we impose a requirement after they graduate where we have paid their tuition that they have to work for us for another five years? Captain Stafford stated once they are completed they go through a process of getting their license through the state and then certified through the county. When completed they are assigned into a paramedic position after that point. This is a sought after position, it is on volunteer basis, they are requesting to go for many reasons.

President Hudley-Hayes reiterated Vice President Tolentino's concerns regarding the financial investment in a member and asked if the member could simply go somewhere else. Captain Stafford stated yes, that could happen. Vice President Tolentino added we ought to encourage members to remain.

Captain Stafford stated we have not had anybody leave right after getting trained as a paramedic. Vice President Tolentino commented he has had friends who get public health monies, trying to become doctors, and they require them five years to remain within public health. President Hudley-Hayes asked we have done the tracking, so we do not have a lot of people that take this and get qualified and leave us? Captain Stafford stated fortunately not, most of them stay.

- B. [BFC 12-057] – 2012 Brush Clearance Appeals Process and Appointment of the Hearing Officers. Approval to hire the following hearing officers to conduct appeals on behalf of the Board of Fire Commissioners: 1) Kelly O'Brien, 2) Adam Kretzmar and 3) Ako B. Eluma.
Recommendation: That the Board approves the report and recommendations.
ACTION: APPROVED.

President Hudley-Hayes asked if the three individuals noted had been hearing officers for us before. Captain Robert Knight, Brush Clearance Program, Fire Prevention Bureau, noted the previous hearing officers were Mr. Kretzmar and Ms. O'Brien. LAFD, with Personnel, did an extensive outreach program to get the most qualified hearing officers that were available and based upon candidates that responded, these two would meet the qualifications and scored the highest. President Hudley-Hayes stated she only wanted to confirm that there were people that had experience with us before that were willing to come back. Captain Knight stated yes.

- C. [BFC 12-060] - In-Kind Donation for Portable Generator Connection
Recommendation: That the Board approves the report and recommendations.
ACTION: APPROVED WITH CORRECTIONS.

President Hudley-Hayes asked if Fire Station 71 is a 501(c)(3) itself. Battalion Chief Hogan stated no, we will do a better job in the future of how that is written. This is a group that has adopted Fire Station 71 and they are the holder of the 501(c)(3), not the members at Fire Station 71. President Hudley-Hayes commented this is confusing, fix it, can you take it away and bring it back because it looks like they have their own 501(c)(3).

Vice President Tolentino stated Commissioner Bontá is no longer here, but her issue had always been whether this is supplementing this fire station, or supplanting, one of the responsibilities of the Department. Would this be the only fire station with this portable generator connection?

Battalion Chief Hogan stated he would say no, that is not the only one, but what they are looking to do is to enhance/augment without taking away or dragging down what the City is already providing. The members are trying to look at better ways to assist. Vice President Tolentino asked is this an important aspect of this Department, for each fire station to have? Battalion Chief Hogan stated he would say yes, but with our current fiscal constraints he does not know if that would be the case. Usually those individual fire stations would look into those matters to make a determination. Vice President Tolentino asked if a fire station that does not have this, is their ability to do their work impeded?

Assistant Chief Donald Frazeur stated that approximately 35 fire stations have the ability to take a portable generator and plug in. That means that there are approximately 70 stations that do not have that capacity and he presumes that is what this connection is about.

President Hudley-Hayes asked whether or not this is a supplantation of, is this something that the City should be providing? Fire Chief Cummings stated it is, but as we prioritize our requests for resources in a fiscally responsible way, this is prioritized fairly far down the list. The ability to get this done by one of the communities that has adopted their station, and the value of it is if there is a catastrophic event and power is out in an area, people can go to their local fire station, if they have power, to get information, to get assistance that they need because that fire station becomes a public safety hub. In a perfect world/budget, we would have all of our stations have this backup capability so we could stand up in an emergency. President Hudley-Hayes stated the answer is yes, this is supplantation of what the City should be doing and as a first responder organization, although the Commission understands it is far down on the list, it is fairly important

because if we had an earthquake and something happened 30 fire stations would be able to “respond” to their communities and 70 fire stations would not. Fire Chief Cummings stated all 106 fire stations would be able to respond to the needs of their community, it is just that only 30 of them will have electric lights backed up through the connection, but every one of our aerial ladder trucks, all 42, have a portable generator on board. As well as our Hazardous Materials Squads, our Urban Search and Rescue Vehicles, our Rehab Air Utilities, so we would have power in ways to assist the communities. Now, this would be a nice enhancement for the stations. Vice President Tolentino stated he would encourage these Adopt-a-Station groups to try and get them in place for every single station.

Brief discussion was held regarding the approval, withdrawal, approval with corrections of the items called Special. Deputy City Attorney Jackson stated Vice President Hudley-Hayes could do a verbal amendment of the report [BFC 12-060] now and approve it as amended. She could also amend Item 6.A. [BFC 12-056] as indicated by the corrected account number.

Battalion Chief Hogan stated he would like to amend BFC 12-060 to read that the Board accept a donation from the Adopt Fire Station 71 Community Group which has the 501(c)(3) status, for the members of Fire Station 71.

MOTION (Tolentino/Friedman): That the Board approve item 6.B. and, 6.A and C. as amended by the speakers.

ADOPTED: AYES – 3 (Absent: Furillo)

8. ITEMS REQUIRING PUBLIC HEARING

A. [BFC 12-055] – Los Angeles Fire Code Public Hearing

Recommendation: The Board directs the Commission Executive Assistant to schedule a Board of Fire Commissioners public hearing and publish the required notices in order to receive public input on the proposed document.

Assistant Chief Frazier stated the Fire Department (LAFD) is planning to replace the Fire Code. He proceeded to introduce some of the members that have been working on this project: Captain Scott Miller has put 10 years of sweat/equity into this project, and his supervisor Battalion Chief Tim Kerbrat. In 1927, the Unified Building Code was established and that provided for public safety and a standard code for building that would not vary from city to city throughout the country. In 1987, the LAFD established the Fire Code, the one they are planning on replacing. That establishes the house rules for public safety, fire safety in the City of Los Angeles. Since 1987, the International Building Code was established and from that comes the California Fire Code that is Title 24, Part 9, of the California Code Regulations, and the nice thing about the International Fire Code and the California Code is that they are integrated, they build on each other. The International Building Code establishes the foundation and the California Code sets further regulations within the state for construction. To make our buildings safer and to work on the issues that we have within the State of California, and our Fire Code is no longer in sync with these codes and we are endeavoring to bring our Fire Code in line with the International and the State Fire Codes.

Assistant Chief Frazier stated the process we endeavor here is we brought to you a proposed draft that we want to publish and seek public input. That is the nature of our request, to establish a public hearing. Once the hearing is completed, we take public input. We will come back with a revised proposal that we would ask the Commission to at that point adopt and then send for approval from City Council. Today we want to inform you that this process is coming on, is going forward, and that we will be accepting public input, reaching out to our partners and

also the public, both electronically and in person, and ultimately coming back with a draft that the Commission can adopt.

President Hudley-Hayes asked we give input to the California Building Code and to the Los Angeles Building Code? Assistant Chief Frazeur responded we do provide input on the Fire Code portion of it. President Hudley-Hayes added and then we are going to integrate this California Fire Code, Title 19, and Title 24? Assistant Chief Frazeur responded we are going to build off of the... Deputy City Attorney Jackson stated no, which is the California version. Assistant Chief Frazeur stated it is the California version, but we have rules that are more refined within the City to provide for the public safety here in Los Angeles. Now our code is going to line up with the other codes so they become easier to use for a professional, i.e., architect.

President Hudley-Hayes asked what this would do when we change it, help the business, help the inspection process, and help the permit process?

Assistant Chief Frazeur stated it is going to streamline the process for anybody that is doing construction or modifications, remodeling, within the City because they will be able to reach out and use the Unified Building Code and it will line up exactly with the Fire Code so that you do not have to cross-reference. We will reach out to stakeholders, as well as make a general announcement to the public for comment. He emphasized they are not introducing any changes to our existing Fire Code; it is a reorganization of existing material so it should be a familiar material for everybody that uses it.

Deputy City Attorney Jackson added they are changing the format so that the format is uniform. Now in Los Angeles, our Code the way it is written and the way it is structured and the numbering system is completely different than others. It is very independent and will now be in line with the State and the Uniform International Code.

Assistant Chief Frazeur added that the International Building Code and the State Building Codes are updated on a three-year cycle. Once we adopt the new Fire Code we will adopt also on a three-year cycle and this will not prevent us from making changes to the Fire Code locally, we will still be able to do that through ordinance.

MOTION (Friedman/Tolentino): That the Board directs the Executive Assistant to schedule a Board of Fire Commissioners public hearing and publish the required notices in order to receive public input on the proposed Fire Code.

ADOPTED: AYES – 3 (Absent: Furillo)

9. REQUEST FOR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

- Report back to the Commission on Mr. Godown's findings regarding LAFD response time data in the next 30 days. [May 15] – See Item 4.A. (Godown).
- Strategic Plan Draft – to Commission in June. – See Item 3.A. (Fire Chief Cummings)
- Councilmember Koretz's motion, written report to the Fire Commission. – See Item 4.D. (Bercik, Varela)
- Status of Automatic Vehicle Location Implementation. Report back in three months [July 17]. – See Item 5.A. (Commissioner Tolentino).
- Items Requiring Public Hearing – CEA to agendize public hearing [May 15].

10. IDENTIFICATION OF THE BOARD'S MEET AND CONFER NEGOTIATORS REGARDING DISCIPLINARY GUIDELINES

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, APRIL 17, 2012

DRAFT

Fire Chief Cummings stated the negotiators are Battalion Chief Chuck Butler and Battalion Chief Richard Rideout.

11. CLOSED SESSION

- A. Conference with negotiators pursuant to Government Code Section 54957.6(a) – To permit the Board to review its negotiating position and instruct its negotiators concerning the conduct of negotiations regarding disciplinary guidelines.

The regular meeting recessed at 10:47 a.m. and the Board went into closed session. Deputy City Attorney Jackson stated to have conference with the negotiators pursuant to Government Code Section 54957.6(a) – To permit the Board to review its negotiating position and instruct its negotiators concerning the conduct of negotiations regarding disciplinary guidelines.

Deputy City Attorney Jackson called the regular meeting to order at 10:51 a.m. and indicated no action was taken in closed session on this item and it will be rescheduled for the next available meeting.

12. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 10:52 a.m.

ATTEST BY:

GENETHIA HUDLEY-HAYES
President

LETICIA GOMEZ
Commission Executive Assistant I

Date: April 26, 2012

Note: Actions of the Board shall become final at the expiration of the next five meeting days of the City Council during which the Council has convened in regular session, unless the Council acts within that time by two-thirds vote to bring the action before it or to waive review of the action.