

CITY OF LOS ANGELES
BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, DECEMBER 6, 2011

DRAFT

The Regular Meeting of the Board of Fire Commissioners convened at 9:06 a.m. in the Fire Commission Meeting Room, City Hall East, 200 N. Main Street, Room 1820, Los Angeles.

▪ **ROLL CALL**

Present: President Genethia Hudley-Hayes
Vice President Casimiro Tolentino
Commissioner Andrew Friedman
Commissioner Jill Furillo
Fire Chief Brian L. Cummings
Deputy City Attorney Julie Raffish

Absent: Commissioner Diana Bontá

▪ **FLAG SALUTE AND MOMENT OF SILENCE**

The flag salute was followed by a moment of silence in honor of past and present members of the Los Angeles Fire Department, the Fire Service, Law Enforcement, EMS and the Military who devote their lives to the protection of the community and of our Country.

1. **PUBLIC COMMENT**

Dr. Tom Williams, LA-32 Neighborhood Council, commented that regarding the complaints that were addressed in a previous meeting; one of the issues that a lot of people do not realize is that there are two sets of brush clearance requirements. One is for the 100 ft., which usually takes in your own parcel, unless you have a very big parcel. But the other one is 200 ft. [he referred to a Google map which he provided]. In this particular figure there is a small line in the middle – that is 200 ft., there is another little line on the right side where you can see that somebody cleared their area and that is 100 ft. from the structure. Question is 200 ft.; if you do not enforce the 200 ft. you are not compliant. If it is within your property you have to clear that, if it is outside your property – whose responsibility is it? There is a question as to if there is a fire that approaches and it comes within the 200 ft. range, fuel modification zone, and it has not been cleared and your house gets ignited by embers, who's responsible for that? Is it the fact that it was not enforced, is it the fact that it was not cleared, is there liability for the City, or for the individual, or the organization owning that property, because he still remembers the videos of the Sears fire where they are bombing the back yards of houses because the fire was at the fence line, 50 ft. Prevention is worth a pound of cure.

2. **COMMISSION BUSINESS**

A. Announcements/Meetings/Events
Considered jointly with Items 3.A. and 3.B.

B. [BFC 11-153] - Approval of Meeting Minutes for October 18, 2011
MOTION (Friedman/Furillo): That the Board approve the minutes as submitted.
ADOPTED: AYES – 4 (Absent: Bontá)

[BFC 11-167] – Approval of Meeting Minutes for November 15, 2011
MOTION (Tolentino/Furillo): That the Board approve the minutes as submitted.
ADOPTED: AYES – 4 (Absent: Bontá)

3. **GENERAL MANAGER'S REPORT**

A. Announcements/Meetings/Events

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, DECEMBER 6, 2011

DRAFT

Items 2.B., 3.A. and 3.B. considered jointly. Fire Chief Cummings noted some of the events he attended since the last Commission meeting: Press Conference with the Mayor, South Division and Battalion 6 in Paseo del Mar for the landslide and closure of Paseo del Mar; Chief of Staff, Chief Vidovich also volunteers as President of Wilmington Boys & Girls Club – volunteered with his family and Fire Chief Cummings at a Thanksgiving Dinner giveaway at Wilmington Boys Club, Kickoff of Spark of Love Toy Drive at Fire Station 48, Press Conference with Mayor and Chief Charlie Beck following LAPD successful operation with Occupy L.A.; Badge Presentation for new Assistant Chief Kwame Cooper, Press Conference at EOC with the Mayor and EMD regarding the high wind event; Chatsworth Chamber of Commerce Breakfast, LAFD's Eighth Graduation of Leadership Academy; conducted an aerial tour in LAFD helicopter with Mayor Villaraigosa, the California Emergency Management Association, Secretary Mike Dayton, Cal EMA Ops Chief Pat Dennen, and EMD Director Jim Featherstone.

Fire Chief Cummings referenced the Calendar of Events provided, and highlighted the following events: December 10 – Annual Pico Union Holiday Celebration, Echo Park Community Parade; December 11 – Celebrate the Feast of Our Lady of Guadalupe, Holiday Parade in Chatsworth and a Holiday Parade in Marina del Rey, and Harbor Holiday Parade. Hopes everyone has safe and happy holidays.

Commissioner Friedman asked if we participated in the Annual Hollywood Christmas Parade. Fire Chief Cummings stated yes, Captain Jaime Moore and his family rode along in a band wagon and Assistant Chief Tim Manning and his family. Commissioner Friedman added that he had an excused absence during the last Commission meeting, possibility the first one in his career as a Commissioner, but would like to suggest, if not discussed at last Commission meeting regarding the Christmas Parade in Hollywood, but usually the Commissioners are invited. He was not invited, perhaps the other Commissioners were, and if they were not, in past years Commissioner Tolentino was also present with his family. Perhaps in the future he can make a note to let the Commissioners know. Fire Chief Cummings stated it was an oversight and would make sure staff would extend that invitation.

The following newly promoted Chief Officers are presented to the Board of Fire Commissioners pursuant to Section 1(g) of the Rules and Regulations:

1. Albert Ward, Battalion Chief, Battalion 18C
2. James Hayden, Battalion Chief, Battalion 10C
3. Carlos Calvillo, Battalion Chief, Battalion 13C
4. Robert Nelson, Battalion Chief, Battalion 18B
5. Elise Brodowy, Battalion Chief, Battalion 13A
6. Steven Gutierrez, Battalion Chief, Battalion 13B
7. Jeffrey Elder, Battalion Chief, Battalion 10A
8. Steve Hissong, Battalion Chief, Battalion 1B

Fire Chief Cummings stated that the list presented included the newest Battalion Chiefs. Battalion Chief James Hayden was present and congratulated by Commission President Hudley-Hayes.

- B. Calendar of Events
Considered jointly with Item 3.A.
- C. Significant Incidents/Activities

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, DECEMBER 6, 2011

DRAFT

1. [BFC 11-172] – Significant Incident Summary report for the period of October 31 through November 6, 2011.
Recommendation: Receive and file.
The report was received and filed.
2. [BFC 11-173] – Significant Incident Summary report for the period of November 7 through November 13, 2011.
Recommendation: Receive and file.
The report was received and filed.
3. [BFC 11-174] – Significant Incident Summary report for the period of November 14 through November 20, 2011.
Recommendation: Receive and file.
The report was received and filed.

Deputy Chief Mario Rueda stated that this past week, on November 29, LAFD participated with LAPD in the eviction of Occupy L.A. in a support capacity with Hazardous Materials resources, decon resources and also EMS. LAFD was there all night supporting LAPD.

Deputy Chief Rueda stated that on Wednesday LAFD went into augmented staffing due to high winds and potential for fire danger; turned out to be one of the most significant winds seen in the City in his career; they clocked over 100 mile an hour gusts at Mt. Washington which is not one of their normal wind corridors; the Northeast area of the City of Los Angeles was significantly impacted; several hundred trees down. About 52 intersections were impacted in the City resulting in a loss of traffic signals. DWP reported about 180,000 residents without power, Griffith Park was closed, and a number of our transportation corridors were blocked either with debris or trees. At one point and time the Dispatch Center, they did an outstanding job of keeping up with the number of calls for service, dispatched a total of 264 calls in one hour period which is a tremendous number of resources running around our streets; most of those were utility calls, wires down where a dangerous condition exists. At one point in time our system was taxed to the point where about 75% of our Fire Stations were empty. It was one of the most significant events we have had in quite a long time, they did experience one grass fire that night, several structure fires, and the grass fire was in the Northeast end of the City, at Occidental College. Firefighters did an outstanding job of containing the fire and keeping it from spreading; they were dealing with 80-100 mile an hour winds in that location. Amazingly, no serious injuries or deaths occurred as a result of this event. Some neighboring cities in the San Gabriel Valley were as seriously impacted and some even more so.

Vice President Tolentino asked if there is a unique response to wind storms, by the Department. Deputy Chief Rueda stated we were augmented due to high fire danger, in most wind situations we actually experienced a number of utility emergencies, traffic problems and in this case that is what they saw, a tremendous number of wires down calls. When the wires come down, they do not de-energize. They energize fences, cars, a variety of other rescue situations that firefighters respond to; cut wires, rescue people, eliminate hazards and that is what they did that night.

President Hudley-Hayes asked if this, in any way, impacted the new Deployment Plan. Fire Chief Cummings stated they were already leaning forward, they staffed up those 18 reserve engines looking at the fire weather condition. Because of the wind they had

them for the additional call load; additionally the Fire Prevention Bureau staffed up 10 or 11 two-person teams that went out to standby on downed wires to standby on downed wires to free-up fire companies; had the same with our CERT callout, CERT members did the same thing. Calls averaged one call coming in every 35 seconds.

President Hudley-Hayes asked if this meant we used more resources, therefore, the impact on our budget now is greater because there is no way to predict this ahead of time. Fire Chief Cummings stated they took this contingency out for that one particular day when they fully staff it is about \$150,000 and because of the very dry weather with the mild Santa Ana conditions in the days since we have been deployed to a lower level ever since, including today where they have 11 engines deployed. We are spending money that is not in the budget that was taken out and will be reporting that back to the City Council.

President Hudley-Hayes thanked Deputy Chief Rueda for the report and she thanked everybody in LAFD, particularly his Bureau, because the response has been extraordinary. It is a testament to the LAFD that we are able to continue to provide this kind of service given the budget cuts and given the reductions we have had. As many times as the Commission might ask questions and ask for answers, she believes it is important for them to congratulate when the Department goes over and above in such an excellent fashion. In her neighborhood they saw many times the fire trucks coming, the response was excellent.

4. OLD BUSINESS

- A. [BFC 10-045] – Fire Department response to the Assessment of the Department Disciplinary Process and Professional Standards Division conducted by the Office of the Independent Assessor [BFC 10-027]
 - 1. [BFC 10-091] – LAFD Implementation Action Plan (IAP) – Department’s response to the 2010 Independent Assessor Audit (Revised 08/31/2010; Supersedes BFC 10-085)

Assistant Chief Roxanne Bercik introduced the seventh new special investigator, Ms. Terra Messina, who comes from the Ethics Commission. She is a law school graduate, was a Sr. Investigator for four years with the Ethics Commission and promoted into the Ethics Program Analyst position. Assistant Chief Bercik stated that they had one candidate decline the position and are reopening it for two weeks and have one more Special Investigator position to fill, along with the Management Analyst position.

Battalion Chief Pat Hayden stated he would provide a status report on the remaining portions of the audit. To date, they are formulating a comprehensive plan to establish a long-term guiding principle with the stakeholder input. They are formulating a strategic method to draft and review and ultimately have approved the PSD manual that has been recommended by our Independent Assessor, Mr. Stephen Miller. Battalion Chief Hayden stated he would be meeting with Mr. Miller in the near future to discuss how to best achieve that goal as well.

Battalion Chief Hayden stated regarding the Skelly process, PSD has brought the Skelly proceedings into compliance with the established due process practices and there are a few issues that still need to be addressed with regard to that process. However, the lion share of the work has been done and a Skelly chapter will be part of that PSD Manual. They are also establishing a process to systematically report back to the Board of Fire Commissioners on how

they will continually establish ongoing dialogue in terms of reporting back to the Commission and will try and infuse that so that those who potentially take their place will have some sort of institutional knowledge in terms of how that should be accomplished.

Lastly, they are developing a process to train, track and document all practices within PSD and to have some sort of written clarification within the PSD Manual in terms of how that documentation will be sustained for the long term.

President Hudley-Hayes asked for clarification regarding guiding principles. Battalion Chief Hayden stated there is one particular area that talks about how they are going to establish guiding principles with regard to the stakeholder process and making sure they infuse stakeholders in their decision making as they move forward. That is something they are going to try to meet with and maybe potentially use their strategic plan as a method for putting that together. President Hudley-Hayes asked meet with whom? Battalion Chief Hayden stated our various stakeholders; he reiterated 'The Department will adopt guiding principles with input from management, labor, stakeholder groups and the Fire Commission that holds sworn members to a higher standard than non-sworn members'. They are going to try and establish a comprehensive plan to establish long term guiding principles with the stakeholders.

Fire Chief Cummings added they are now looking at bringing it back to the Fire Commission's Personnel Committee and discussing both the Preamble to the Rules and Regs and that guiding principle. Basically, the guiding principle is to hold sworn members to a higher standard. President Hudley-Hayes confirmed Fire Chief would let the Commission know when he wants that brought back; be sure to let Commissioner Tolentino know as he is the Chair. Fire Chief Cummings responded that the Chief of Staff will be reaching out to him to schedule that as soon as possible.

- B. [BFC 11-169] – Deployment Plan Analysis and Report
Recommendation: That the Board receive the report and approve the recommendations.

Deputy Chief Rueda reported that the analysis deals with four months of data. The goal in writing this report was to understand whether the Deployment Plan is working; where is it working; where it is not working, why, what are the operational and other impacts and what the necessary modifications are. The report itself deals with the history of our changes in deployment over the last three years; it also details both EMS and Non-EMS response goals and data. It compares over one million responses that they had prior to 2009 and compares them against four months of data that has been collected since the Deployment has been put in place. Basically, the data that is included in the report is four data sets and lastly the overall and then the specific impacts they have seen so far in the report.

Deputy Chief Rueda stated he would provide a brief discussion of response times. The Deployment Plan has been in place since July 3 and it deals with about 100,000 responses and that is compared to over a million responses. In looking at the data so far, there have been some anomalies, some areas of concern that they have seen both in the data and that they have received feedback from the field resources that are responding on these calls. They believe that six months of data, along with a survey that is currently with Battalion Chiefs and Assistant Chiefs, in looking at not only the data, but the day-to-day impacts they are seeing will provide the Department sufficient information with which to make changes to our deployment, although there are some immediate concerns he would like to share with Commissioners.

Concerns to date; they have 7 EMS Captains during their daily deployment covering the entire City. It is not uncommon for EMS Captains to respond over 10 miles on responses; it is not

uncommon for EMS to be responding from the San Fernando Valley to the Metro area on responses. That is a significant response and response time. Regarding Emergency Incident Technicians, they are seeing in the data both increases in response times for Battalion Chiefs and they are also seeing impacts on the fire ground, i.e. at emergencies with Battalion Chiefs running into difficulties managing larger scale emergencies. Regarding Hazardous Materials responses, they have had one that he reported at UCLA, will customarily now eat up nearly half of the City's Hazardous Materials responses on a single response routinely when they get those calls. They have seen workload and response time issues that are in specific Districts which are in the data sets. As he has reported here, coverage issues on September 5th when they had a fire in the Northeast area of the City along with a fire in Mandeville Canyon simultaneously depleted several stations of resources. During these wind events, although augmented, back to what our old normal use to be, they had nearly 75 Stations vacant during that time.

They are also seeing impacts to administrative workload, Fire Prevention, other areas that have been impacted by the Deployment; those are the known impacts on which they are getting feedback. Some they are seeing in the data, some they are not. As previously stated, their next steps would be to compile input they are taking from the field; look at six full months of data and recommend changes to the Fire Chief at that point.

Commissioner Furillo referenced page six of the report, 'response time did increase but the overall impact is minimal' – she asked for clarification. Deputy Chief Rueda stated as they measure the entire system, the best graph to go to is Attachment #1, Measurement 3, that is the measurement of what we have today vs. what we had in August 2009. That is a true comparison of pre-changes to our Deployment to what we have today. As a system our EMS performance change for the first unit on scene of an EMS as you can see, overall system impact is actually very minimal.

President Hudley-Hayes asked for clarification regarding Attachment #1, Measurement 3, and Fire Station 28. Deputy Chief Rueda stated that if it is below the line it is a decline in performance which would be an increased response time; this is one of the issues that causes him to recommend to the Fire Chief they need six months of data; 28's changed from a Light Force (truck and pump) to an Engine Company (paramedic remained on the Engine Company), it is in the Porter Ranch area. In theory, they should not have a change of response, because they really stayed neutral in terms of their EMS resources; they probably should have had an improvement because the Engine, by itself, is actually quicker than taking the ladder truck and the pump, but we did not see an improvement, they saw a decline in performance. That is one of those anomalies they cannot explain yet; it may be that the data is insufficient at this point.

President Hudley-Hayes commented as they tap into it with a better longitudinal study they may be able to figure out what that is and talk to the Commission better; look at it maybe 9 months out and 12 months out, the data may shift, or at least they may some idea why that is so, because that is troubling.

Deputy Chief Rueda stated there were a couple of others that he wanted to point out to the Commissioners; Attachment #5 – 1st Resource on scene in other first-in districts, Measurement 3; measuring our Department's performance from August 2009 (old normal) to what we currently deploy today. There are improvements in some areas and in others there are fairly significant performance declines, i.e. Fire Station 28, 27. Fire Station 27, Hollywood area, population spikes sometimes 500,000 to 1 million people; the call load spikes, they do move additional resources, but they have also seen a decline to performance with respect to response times and these are basically for fire calls. At the end of the graph, Fire Station 105; that is an

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, DECEMBER 6, 2011

DRAFT

area in which they did eliminate 1 resource and we can see their performance and their response to fire calls has declined. These are areas they know they are having some performance issues, but they would like to see 6 months of data along with the actual input prior to making any dramatic changes to their deployment.

President Hudley-Hayes asked the location of Fire Station 105 and Fire Station 49, Deputy Chief Rueda stated on Fallbrook in the West end of the San Fernando Valley and Terminal Island respectively. Fire Chief Cummings commented Wilmington actually – regarding Fire Station 49. President Hudley-Hayes stated its performance has fallen too. Deputy Chief Rueda stated that it may be just that they got too few calls to register an accurate data set. Some of these did have enough calls that they know they are a problem now and they hear from the people too, they have increased their call load.

Deputy Chief Rueda stated the last graph he wanted to point out to Commissioners is Attachment #8 – Battalion Chief Average Response Time; they have seen a significant decline in the response performance of their Battalion Chiefs. Some are significant time measurements. Measurement 3 compares them with what they saw August 2009 to present. Some of the declines in response are significant in some first-in districts. President Hudley-Hayes asked the location of Fire Station 40; Fire Chief Cummings stated on Terminal Island, 49 is in Wilmington, very slow resource not a large group of incidents so one or two long responses could seriously affect it, but they are looking at everything.

Deputy Chief Rueda stated that what they have seen is those areas that remove their Staff Aide or their Emergency Incident Technician; when they group those, their response time has increased significantly. President Hudley-Hayes asked the location of Fire Station 57; Deputy Chief Rueda stated at 78th and Vermont. Fire Chief Cummings commented it is one of their busiest companies in the City; there is a statistical set there that they can look and make some good predictions.

President Hudley-Hayes asked if they are impacted in any way by the loss of the Staff Assistants. Fire Chief Cummings responded they are now the Emergency Incident Technicians. Deputy Chief Rueda stated that when they group those areas together that lost that position, their response time has increased significantly. What that amounts to is longer time to get on scene, longer time to release the first line supervisor to be with his fire company, so there are a number of impacts beyond; there definitely are impacts.

President Hudley-Hayes stated Deputy Chief Rueda was right, a long time ago when he predicted longer response times. Commissioner Friedman supported Commissioner Hudley-Hayes' point; he does not think they are surprised by this data, this is to be expected with the budget cut and the result in reduction of firefighters; he does not think that they should be surprised.

President Hudley-Hayes added she thinks they should keep in mind – since she read in the newspaper that there will be a budget shortfall between now and June – and people will be asked to cut more (although she did not see the LAFD in the article she read), but she believes they should be very clear about is they are not surprised about this because they anticipated it, and that has a lot to do with the Fire Department internally, but they should be keeping this information in front of people because she does not want to wake up and find that we are being asked now to take another hit before the end of June. Whatever we need to do proactively about that, the Commission needs to join with Fire Chief Cummings in making sure that people are aware of it. She asked who else sees this information; Deputy Chief Rueda stated this is a public document; Public Safety would likely see this document next.

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, DECEMBER 6, 2011

DRAFT

President Hudley-Hayes confirmed the Public Safety Committee and asked if they had been given a presentation on this; Fire Chief Cummings responded not yet, but that is coming up, they requested a presentation and he stated the Department would get it to them after it had been presented to the Fire Commission. President Hudley-Hayes stated we need to make sure that they get this presentation, that it is robust, and if necessary one of the Commissioners could join to lend their support.

Deputy Chief Rueda commented that at Fire Chief Cummings direction some of the mitigation that they have taken to try to reduce risk as a result of some of these impacts has been the pre-deployment as Fire Chief Cummings mentioned. They have been in pre-deployment for the last six days and one of those days was when they did not reach their criteria, but they were close enough that the Fire Chief directed that they pre-deploy. So those high risk days, they are trying to do their best to predict and try to mitigate some of the impacts they are seeing.

Commissioner Furillo agreed we should not be surprised because the Commission predicted this when they wrote their letter to the Mayor and City Council regarding their concerns about the Plan; when they go back to looking and were concerned about the reduction of the EMS Captains, reduction of so many different services that this would happen and in fact now this data, even though they need more time, she is concerned about the fact that in just a four month period of time they are seeing this data. There have been a couple of fires this year, but it could have been a lot worse, we have had early rains this year, the fire season could have been much worse. Deputy Chief Rueda stated it is not over.

Commissioner Furillo thanked Deputy Chief Rueda for putting together this data and being very transparent with the data, there is no attempt to make everything look good when it is not. That is what the Commission needs and what the City Council needs as we move forward and try to figure out what they will do about this; she recalls when the Mayor spoke about the resources to the Fire Department and the fact they were cutting the budget; he had said in moving forward with that Plan he did not want to see this kind of result.

President Hudley-Hayes stated that with the permission of the other Commissioners, they are asking Fire Chief Cummings that they would like to see the Department being very proactive about this; she would not want to see the budget cut again, and she knows that every City Department has to sacrifice, but when it leads to this kind of thing and we are the first responders in terms of safety of life and property, mostly life, she thinks we should get on this very quickly before any of that conversation comes up. Because it made her very uncomfortable to see that in the paper, even though the LAFD was not mentioned, she was clear that it was an oversight. She thinks that is what happens, they do not say it in the paper and the next thing you know this kind of stuff happens; she knows Ms. Mattera is watching because she was in the budget office.

President Hudley-Hayes inquired regarding page 4 of the Board Report – it states that one Division Office and two Battalion Offices were permanently closed. Deputy Chief Rueda stated that formerly, in August 2009, they had a three division organization each day so each Division Commander would roughly have 5-6 Battalions each and supervise those people and have basically a third of the City as their responsibility. The Deployment since July is two Division Offices which give them 7 Battalions each and a response area from Northeast L.A. to San Pedro would be one area and the second would be West L.A. (Palisades area) to Hollywood, including all the San Fernando Valley would be the other Division. They went from 16 Battalions to 14 Battalions with the elimination of two Battalions. One was in the East L.A. area which was absorbed by two other Battalions and the other was in the South Los Angeles area,

from about Washington Blvd. to about 55th Street and that has been absorbed by other adjacent battalions, but it does create a very large response district, sometimes the size of cities.

President Hudley-Hayes stated because we had to close these we now have more pressure and more pressure from people in supervisorial positions, not just with response times and EMS and fire response; also the fact that they are now having a greater responsibility for the other things we are concerned about in terms of monitoring behavior and stations. Fire Chief Cummins stated more stations and a larger span of control. President Hudley-Hayes stated that she wanted to make sure that this is done in such a way that the kind of transparency they are getting here this morning is the kind of transparency that gets to the City Council, she knows he is doing it with the Mayor, but to the City Council as well; they really need to have this stuff in front of them ahead of time so they are aware of it.

Fire Chief Cummings stated that ASB along with Mr. Martinez, Ms. Ocon and Ms. Mattera and the Chief of Staff and Planning Section Chief have been meeting with Council staff; they have met with the CAO, CLA and are making sure the information is getting to them to understand the impact and how thin LAFD is when they get to those busy times of the day, and that this is a base level deployment, cutting further resources impacts negatively on public safety.

President Hudley-Hayes commented that they also need to be aware about the costs that there is no way to be able to predict them, i.e. wind; do they ever think in terms of the fact of what needs to happen for the LAFD is contingency money? Fire Chief Cummings stated that was part of the budget process, they asked for \$3.1 million in contingency for days like today or the high wind event, or as they get into the critical brush season, but that was taken out of the budget and they were told to report back on what they spend and that the CAO would then give them the money to reimburse those things. President Hudley-Hayes commented to Ms. Mattera that they need to make sure they get that contingency money back in because we are on the razor's edge and have no contingency for it; she agrees with Deputy Chief Rueda that they have not gotten through fire season yet, it could be devastating because now there are the winds and drying up and all that brush out there; they need to be proactive because she is not comfortable that somebody is not going to say they need another 10% or 5% cut.

President Hudley-Hayes thanked the group of people that put the report together, it is one of the best reports that she has ever read as a Commissioner. Deputy Chief Rueda stated it was the Planning staff and Chief Deputy Frazier. President Hudley-Hayes stated as they are laypersons, she could understand everything; it was absolutely outstanding work. Fire Chief Cummings agreed, he added that when looking at the graphs you do have to realize that the scale changes from graph to graph. They will go back and make sure there are identical scales on all of the graphs, but always check the scale to the far left; outstanding data collection and compiling this report by Planning and Chief Deputy Frazier.

PUBLIC COMMENT: Mr. Pat McOsler, United Firefighters, commented he appreciated the line of questions he is hearing from everybody and he can tell they are concerned about the fact that we have increased response times and significantly in certain areas and with certain resources. He wants everyone to work together; he does not feel like up to this point, regarding our budget cuts and closures, Union and Management has worked together. In the days when we did our best in terms of staffing and resources, when Jim Hahn was the Mayor, those were not particularly good budget times, but we did our best then because they would come together, especially through the budget process. They would sit down, decide together what the priorities were, what the wish list was, what they were going to fight for and go forward together and side-by-side in Council, sitting together at the table. They have not done that through this crisis; they have been saying one thing and Management has been saying something different; they have

BOARD OF FIRE COMMISSIONERS
MINUTES
TUESDAY, DECEMBER 6, 2011

DRAFT

been more public and there have been different priorities about what needs to be preserved and where they cannot fight so hard; they will need to do this together if they will be successful because there are increased response times and it is affecting public and firefighter safety right now.

Dr. Williams stated he had already submitted a document on this. Basic element, what is the Brush Fire Operations Plan, he has not been able to find it, but it is referenced in this report. There are a bunch of variations, a bunch of overalls and increases and minimizing and not predicting. It comes down to a couple of things; they have Station 47 and 16, if you look at the charts for the Non-EMS, fire calls, they have rather poor performance, he does not know why, but it does say individual districts show more variation or variance. Varies significantly in different part of the City – what does that mean? Does that mean some parts of the City are not provided with the same level of fire protection, which ones, why? Are Engine 47 and a couple of the others the worst performing 5 or 10 out of 100? This becomes statistically significant; also who was the predictor of this? Additionally, it gives no assumption based upon the predictions or what was the policy that was the fundamental basis for this report and for this deployment plan.

Commissioner Furillo asked when this item would be presented to the Council. Fire Chief Cummings stated it would first be scheduled in Public Safety and with the holidays he is not sure how soon that will be, could be as soon as next Friday; Public Safety wanted to hear it as soon after it was brought to Fire Commission as possible.

President Hudley-Hayes asked Fire Chief Cummings to inform the Commission ahead of time so someone from the Commission can be there; she asked that the Commission know in plenty of time. Fire Chief Cummings stated that the Chief of Staff would make sure that Public Safety is contacted and find out when it is going to be put on the agenda and let the Commissioners know as soon as possible. President Hudley-Hayes also requested that the Public Safety Committee be advised that there is a possibility that someone from the Commission might want to speak to this issue with the Fire Department; for them to know that the Commission is in concert with the Department; she agrees with Mr. McOsker that they all need to be in concert about this item. She thinks there is more bad news to come in terms of people getting their budgets chopped and she is not interested in that at all.

Commissioner Furillo commented that we are going into an election year and she is being contacted by many different people about various initiatives moving forward that would be addressing budget issues. Because the issue around the budget will be impacted by certain types of initiatives that will be coming forward to generate revenue; there are organizations that are putting some very serious effort into certain types of revenue.

MOTION (Friedman/Furillo): That the Board receive the report and approve the recommendations.

ADOPTED: AYES – 4 (Absent: Bontá)

5. NEW BUSINESS

None.

6. NEW BUSINESS – CONSENT ITEMS

A. [BFC 11-166] – In-Kind Donation for Holmatro Tool with Accessories and Stihl Chain Saw with Carrying Case

Recommendation: That the Board approves the report and recommendations.

ACTION: APPROVED.

- B. [BFC 11-168] – Write-off of Uncollectible LAFD Emergency Ambulance Services Charges Each Valued Less Than \$5,000 for Fiscal Years 2004-05 to 2010-11
Recommendation: That the Board approves the report and recommendations.
ACTION: APPROVED.
- C. [BFC 11-170] – 2011-2012 Annual Organization Chart
Recommendation: That the Board approves the report and recommendations.
ACTION: APPROVED.
- D. [BFC 11-171] – In-Kind Donation for Supplies to Build a BBQ
Recommendation: That the Board approves the report and recommendations.
ACTION: APPROVED.
- E. [BFC 11-175] - Corrective Action Summary – Notice of Discharge, Suspension, or Probationary Termination reports filed with the Board of Fire Commissioners – November 2 through November 18, 2011.
Recommendation: Receive and file.
ACTION: RECEIVED AND FILED.

MOTION (Furillo/Tolentino): That the Board approve the consent items.

ADOPTED: AYES – 4 (Absent: Bontá)

7. ITEMS CALLED SPECIAL

President Hudley-Hayes stated she had a question regarding Item 6.A. and 6.D; she thought that donations went to the Foundation and then went out to the Stations. She thought we were trying to stop this going straight to Stations because there was some issue about whether or not there was equity or fairness; there was a reason why the Foundation was started.

Captain Tina Haro responded they still have kind of a parallel track, there is an in-kind donation and then there is the Foundation donation. The in-kind donation for instance for the Holmatro Tool and Chain Saw came from the Arleta Neighborhood Council and an anonymous donor; that person specifically asked to donate something to that Station. President Hudley-Hayes commented it is not money it is absolutely the tools. Captain Haro agreed and stated then it goes through their Office and gets approved by the Fire Commission and/or goes on to Public Safety and Council. President Hudley-Hayes confirmed it was the same situation for the Supplies for the BBQ pit; it is really not monetary as much as it is equipment.

Vice President Tolentino commented that if it is a very specific tool that is really lifesaving and really needed, let's see if it can be put into the budget so that all the Stations that need it also get it. Let's not supplant the kinds of tools that this Department needs to do its job with donations.

Captain Haro stated that the tool issue and emergency equipment goes through Deputy Chief Rueda's office and is appropriately reviewed. President Hudley-Hayes clarified, regarding 6.A.; does everybody need these item/tools/accessories? Fire Chief Cummings stated not necessarily, their aerial ladder trucks carry a different compliment than their engine companies, and typically the Holmatro tools (rescue tool for extrications for car accidents), and chain saws are carried on truck companies. If an engine company has that type of incident, OCD dispatches the nearest of their 42 truck companies to assist. However, some of the engine companies, whether it is approved, are getting the rescue tools and chainsaws so they can cancel the truck company and handle those incidents themselves. Should they get them for every engine company? As a budget priority, it would not be one that they have in

extremely tight resources. However, an in-kind donation, if they can support the maintenance of it in their budget, is welcome.

8. REQUEST FOR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

- BFC 11-169, Commissioners be informed when item is scheduled for Public Safety Committee and City Council – See Item 4.B. (Hudley-Hayes)

9. IDENTIFICATION OF THE BOARD'S MEET AND CONFER NEGOTIATORS REGARDING DISCIPLINARY GUIDELINES

Fire Chief Cummings stated there was no update on Disciplinary Guidelines at this time.

10. CLOSED SESSION

- A. Conference with negotiators pursuant to Government Code Section 54957.6(a) – To permit the Board to review its negotiating position and instruct its negotiators concerning the conduct of negotiations regarding disciplinary guidelines.

None.

11. ADJOURNMENT

The meeting adjourned at 10:10 a.m.

ATTEST BY:

GENETHIA HUDLEY-HAYES
President

LETICIA GOMEZ
Commission Executive Assistant I

Date: December 14, 2011

Note: Actions of the Board shall become final at the expiration of the next five meeting days of the City Council during which the Council has convened in regular session, unless the Council acts within that time by two-thirds vote to bring the action before it or to waive review of the action.