The Regular Meeting of the Board of Fire Commissioners convened at 9:04 a.m. in the Fire Commission Meeting Room, City Hall East, 200 N. Main Street, Room 1820, Los Angeles.

- **ROLL CALL**
  
  Present:  
  - President Genethia Hudley-Hayes  
  - Vice President Casimiro Tolentino  
  - Commissioner Andrew Friedman  
  - Commissioner Jill Furillo  
  - Fire Chief Brian Cummings  
  - Deputy City Attorney Janet Jackson

- **FLAG SALUTE AND MOMENT OF SILENCE**
  
  The flag salute was followed by a moment of silence in honor of past and present members of the Los Angeles Fire Department, the fire service, law enforcement, EMS and the military who devote their lives to the protection of the community and of our country.

1. **PUBLIC COMMENT**
   
   None.

2. **COMMISSION BUSINESS**

   **A. Announcements/Meetings/Events**
   
   Considered jointly with Items 3.A. and 3.B.

   At 9:22 a.m. the Board recessed the regularly scheduled meeting to hold the Special meeting agendized for 9:15 a.m. The regularly scheduled meeting was called back to order at 10:05 a.m., with all commissioners present.

   **B. [BFC 12-016] - Approval of Meeting Minutes for January 17, 2012**
   
   **MOTION** (Tolentino/Friedman): That the Board approve the minutes as submitted.
   
   **ADOPTED**: AYES – 4

   **C. Update from Fire Commission Human Relations Development (HRDC)/Personnel Committee.**
   
   **Recommendation**: That the Board provides instruction to staff and adopts any necessary action relative to matters considered by or referred to the Committee.

   
   **Recommendation**: Receive and file.

   Discussion was held regarding redundancies in the report, the Fire Chief’s Preamble vs. the Fire Chief’s letter, Planning Section’s anticipated completion date, and the overall timeline for project. Fire Chief Cummings stated the report would return at the second meeting in May.

   **Public Comment**: Mr. Pat McOsker commented that there was nothing in the report related to the “meet and confer” process. The Fire Chief responded saying the process was ongoing and labor will receive things as they come in.
3. GENERAL MANAGER’S REPORT

A. Announcements/Meetings/Events

1. The following newly promoted chief officers were presented to the Board of Fire Commissioners pursuant to Section 1(g) of the Rules and Regulations:

   - David Yamahata, Chief Deputy, Emergency Operations
   - Daren M. Palacios, Chief Deputy, Administrative Operations
   - Roxanne V. Bercik, Deputy Chief, Training and Support Bureau
   - Dean Ulrich, Assistant Chief, Professional Standards Division
   - Corinne B. Tipton, Battalion Chief, Homeland Security

2. Letters of Appreciation:

   - LAFD Spark of Love Toys for Needy Children Program
   - Rey Rojo, June Andrade, Michael Marquez, Ray Topete, and Battalion Chief Rudy Hill – Cadet Volunteers

   - 2011 “International Association of Fire Fighters (IAFF) Blog of the Year”
   - Public Service Officers: Brian Humphrey, Erik Scott and Matthew Spence

Items 2.A., 3.A. and 3.B. considered jointly. Fire Chief Cummings referenced the Calendar of Events provided, and some events highlighted included: March is Operation Right Move Campaign Month, March 10 – International Women’s Week Event for the Caring of People & the Planet, March 17 – Annual St. Baldrick’s Cure for Child Cancer Charity Event, March 18 – Los Angeles Marathon, March 21 – Firefighter of the Year for 2011 for A/O Doak S. Smith, March 31 – Bangladesh Day Parade, and March 31 through April 1 – Bangladesh Day Festival.

Fire Chief Cummings acknowledged the newly promoted chief officers present, presented Letters of Appreciation to members of the LAFD Spark of Love Toys for Needy Children Program, and recognized the recipients of the 2011 “International Association of Fire Fighters (IAFF) Blog of the Year”.

President Hudley-Hayes congratulated the recently promoted chief officers on behalf of the Commission.

Chief Corey Rose was also presented as the new president of the Chief Officers Association.

B. Calendar of Events
   Considered jointly with Item 3.A.

C. Verbal report regarding the Department’s compliance with each request of the Board of Review for Write-offs dated September 21, 2011 and December 7, 2011.

   Mr. Sal Martinez, Chief Management Analyst, Administrative Services Bureau, provided a verbal update on this item.

D. Significant Incidents/Activities
1. Verbal report on the occurrence of arson fires in the Hollywood area over the holiday season; the Department's response including prevention, suppression and apprehension of the arson suspect; and current status.

Commissioner Furillo congratulated the Department on the apprehension of the arson suspect.

Battalion Chief Michael Greenup, Arson/Counterterrorism Section, Emergency Services Bureau, provided a detailed PowerPoint presentation.

Recommendation: Receive and file.

Recommendation: Receive and file.

Recommendation: Receive and file.

Recommendation: Receive and file.

Recommendation: Receive and file.

Recommendation: Receive and file.

Deputy Chief Mario Rueda, Emergency Services Bureau, reported on the Significant Incident Summary reports listed as well as a March 3 incident involving a victim who used her cell phone to direct rescuers to her. Vice President Tolentino inquired regarding the four firefighters injured, which were noted on the reports. Chief Rueda confirmed they were all OK. All reports were received and filed.

E. Verbal report on the disposition of LAFD matters considered by or referred to City Council/Committees during the period of January 18 through March 6, 2012.
Recommendation: That the Board provides instruction to staff and adopts any necessary action relative to the LAFD matters considered by or referred to City Council/Committee during the reporting period.

Assistant Chief John Vidovich, Chief of Staff, reported on the Department’s presentations to the Public Safety Committee, City Council, and a motion by Councilmember Englander regarding FIRESTAT with a report back in 60 days.

F. Status of report on the EEOC claim of Anthony Almeida and Department’s implementation of settlement agreement.
Chief Deputy Palacios, Administrative Operations, said a complete report would be provided at the next meeting. He also said training materials had been obtained, the Department was working on the curriculum and the required posting had been done.

4. OLD BUSINESS

A. Verbal report on the *Recruiting and Retaining Diversity in the Fire Service Workshop* on February 2 and 3, 2012.

Captain Kristin Crowley, Recruit Services Section, Training & Support Bureau, reported on who attended the workshop and that they had completed an action plan for the Department. Commissioner Furillo asked for a copy of the plan. Vice President Tolentino asked if this would be incorporated into recruitment. Captain Crowley said they would use the employee organizations to help.

B. [BFC 12-039] – Status Update on the Department’s Response to the Assessment of the Department’s Disciplinary Process and Professional Standards Division

Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.

Vice President Tolentino expressed concern regarding Attachment 2012-2. He stated it feels like we are reinventing the wheel.

Battalion Chief Pat Hayden stated having been placed on this assessment in September 2011, he needed to get caught up, and in meeting with the City Attorney they are further along than what was indicated prior to his Board report. He confirmed that at a subsequent meeting, he will be able to give the Board a more definitive idea of where the City Attorney sits.

President Hudley-Hayes stated she wanted to make a new request. At one point in time, during the Stakeholders process, the issue was raised about the population of the Board of Rights. They were interested in a more diverse team and thought that there should be a civilian. Not that there is a problem with chief officers, but explore whether or not it would be appropriate for a captain to sit on a Board of Rights because they have huge supervisory responsibility and are in the stations where a lot of the discipline happens. Can we somehow capture that conversation?

President Hudley-Hayes asked Mr. Stephen Miller, Independent Assessor, if he captured this issue in his initial report. The notion of the fact that during the Stakeholders process we were talking about taking a look at, not asking to change it, the inclusion of civilians and captains in addition to chief officers.

Mr. Miller stated the discussion about the composition of the Board of Rights has reached back as far as some of the original audits that were conducted by both the Personnel Department and the Controller’s Office. He also addressed it in his report and made some recommendations about changes. The Stakeholders process, before his arrival, talked about the composition of the Board of Rights too. The bottom line is that the composition is described by the Charter now, in Section 1060, and so any change to the composition of three chief officers sitting as three jurors would have to be changed by way of a vote of the electorate.

Mr. Miller stated that there have been a number of proposals to change from three chief officers to one or two officers and a civilian member, much like the Police Department, and there are other proposals as well.
President Hudley-Hayes stated she wanted to make sure we can incorporate that and look at that because she thinks that will be critical in terms of the problems that we run into with discipline. We always run into the problem of whether members of a bargaining unit are reporting on the same members of the bargaining unit; whether it is a good idea to have a captain sit on a Board of Rights or whether it should be all civilian; but if we can in some way begin to think through how that gets incorporated and understanding what happens with the City Charter.

Fire Chief Cummings stated the Department would have to work with our labor unions to look at those Charter changes before we can take them forward, but yes we are looking at that.

PUBLIC COMMENT: Mr. Pat McOsker, President, United Firefighters of Los Angeles City (UFLAC), stated it seems the process moves forward and then maybe an acknowledgement that we should be meeting and conferring. We should be meeting and conferring right at the beginning of the desire to change something that affects our working conditions, to change the City Charter, and in this case it affects discipline.

Mr. McOsker stated that regarding the composition of a Board of Rights, he thinks they have already made a proposal about changing the process. Regarding the notion that a captain should sit on the Board of Rights, his problem with that is that they are members of the same bargaining unit. What he sees happening in this focus on discipline is this larger and larger role in investigating and enforcing, and maybe now decisions by one segment of his bargaining unit, i.e. captains, against the others - the folks that they work with on fire trucks. His perspective is to get captains out of that business. They should be counseling, admonishing, keeping members in line, helping them stay in line, but not judge and jury on them; that weakens the bargaining unit. He does not want captains on a Board of Rights; he does not want captains investigating/reporting.

President Hudley-Hayes commented maybe the problem is in the way that the bargaining units are organized. Maybe you take a look at whether or not those people who are responsible for supervisory things should be in a different bargaining unit. Maybe they need to be in the chief officers bargaining unit as opposed to the firefighters bargaining unit.

Deputy City Attorney Janet Jackson cautioned the Board that we are straying far from the original topic: Status Update on the Department’s Response to the Assessment of the Department’s Disciplinary Process and Professional Standards Division report.

President Hudley-Hayes requested that this be a future agenda item.

Ms. Leticia Gómez, Board Secretary, asked for confirmation if the report was being withdrawn and a report would follow for a future meeting. President Hudley-Hayes stated yes.

Commissioner Furillo commented regarding some of the issues raised. There have got to be specific governing laws that determine bargaining unit clarification of what is appropriate for a given bargaining unit. We are going to have to go back to the drawing board and look at those laws and look at whatever body is responsible for making that determination.

Commissioner Friedman stated that any change in the composition of the Board of Rights has to come through a Charter Amendment.
C. Status of Deployment Plan Analysis and Report [BFC 11-169]

Chief Rueda stated the Department looked at six months worth of data that resulted from our change of deployment on July 1st; 180 days worth of data and about 187,000 incidents. There is not a written report and the referenced report is the one previously provided. Over the past two months they reviewed the data and looked at some of the areas of concern, and this past week the Fire Chief approved 11 adjustments. There are also two trial programs that are proposed as part of the adjustments. All 11 adjustments did not come from the data, they came from outreach that the Administration did to our Command Officers and what they were seeing at the fire station and battalion level with respect to deployment.

Chief Rueda stated there are areas that remain concerns: EMS captain deployment, Emergency Incident Technicians, workload issues in some areas, coverage issues at certain times of day or when weather creates issues, hazardous materials response and administrative workloads at some of those fire stations. He stated they looked at those and looked at the data and are still going through analysis, but these are the changes that are recommended to the [Fire] Chief and he approved those for deployment. They are working towards deployment on April 1st.

Vice President Tolentino stated the Commission got those changes in the Fire Chief’s Updates and the report is excellent and comprehensive. He asked Ms. Gómez if this item was coming to all Commissioners. Ms. Gómez confirmed the item was provided by Chief Vidovich. Vice President Tolentino commented the Department is still at a five-minute response and have met it 63% of the time.

Chief Rueda stated five minutes, 90% of the time - that is the goal. Fire Chief Cummings stated it was 63% before the deployment and 60% currently. Chief Rueda stated they are looking at a lot of data: various fire station first-in districts, areas of the City, and different times of day. They looked at six months worth of data, took input/recommendations from the field. They will continue to look at the data and provide a written report on the supporting documentation that goes with these.

Fire Chief Cummings stated that there are 850 EMS calls per day, and as they look at that data, there is a need for additional ambulances. They need both EMT and paramedic ambulances there, it is one of our critical needs, but additionally critical civilian support staff is needed as well because they are what is behind our ability to make sure we are responding in a timely manner to these emergency responses. If we look at that five-minute-response goal, where that is most critical is for those highest level ALS/EMS calls; the C and D type calls where we need to get that intervention quickly. We are on scene, on average, in 4 minutes and 45 seconds. We hit that goal of less than 5 minutes 64% of the time. We have that first ALS resource on scene where our goal is 9 minutes, 92% of the time. On those most critical EMS calls we are doing very well in meeting the goals that we need to meet.

PUBLIC COMMENT: Mr. McOsker stated he agreed we need more civilian staff and more ambulances and fire companies and hazmat units. We need to do better because we are actually getting there within 5 minutes a little bit less than 60% of the time and it is unacceptable, and it has gotten worse because of the closures as he said it would. What will really be significant is those bad ones, those long responses, the 9-10 minute response to a particular serious, life and death in the balance type incident. The standard deviation shows that we are not bunched around 5 minutes with all of the calls; some are way out which have caused a lot of bad outcomes. He stated he has a meeting at 12:00 p.m. with a Councilmember about this [issue]. We need to add resources. We are closing 20 companies a day for routine business. He wants a gradual restoration for a five-year plan.
5. NEW BUSINESS

A. [BFC 12-015] – Request to Amend Los Angeles City Ordinance No. 171714 (Revolving Training Fund)
Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.

Captain Mark Curry, In-Service Training Section, Training & Support Bureau, summarized the report provided.

PUBLIC COMMENT: Mr. McOsker stated he goes to Sacramento every year to lobby their issues, and every year this is an issue because it is always on the chopping block. This is an education block grant, we the unions lobbied for this apprenticeship program for firefighters in the state and we have to fight for the money every year. In November, he had concerns that they have not audited the money that has been spent over the last five years and is concerned about whether or not it is being spent appropriately. We jointly agree on what we are suppose to spend the money on via a letter of agreement, but he never knows that what comes out mirrors what they have approved. So, he wrote a letter to the Fire Chief on November 29 asking for an accounting of the last 5 years of expenditures and has not received anything back. He also faxed a copy of the letter to the City Controller asking for help. She provided him a recording of the last $2 million that have been in spent over the last 5-6 years, but it does not necessarily correlate with our approval to spend the money. At this point, he is not approving any expenditure until he sees an accounting of how the money has been spent for the last 5-6 years.

Captain Curry stated the annual report is prepared by Ms. Rachawn Baker and it can take from a month to six weeks to collect the data from all sections for a complete report.

Discussion was held regarding how the system is set up and the need for it to be fixed.

MOTION (Furillo/Tolentino): That the Board approve the report and recommendations.
ADOPTED: AYES – 4

B. [BFC 12-017] – Envision Our LAFD – Strategic Planning Process
Recommendation: Receive and file.
The report was received and filed.

Fire Chief Cummings stated Dr. Pat Lynch will be here at the next Commission meeting to do a verbal report on this item.

Recommendation: Receive and file.
The report was received and filed.

Battalion Chief Graham Everett, Professional Standards Division, stated that he had been assigned to Internal Affairs since early 2009 and provided a PowerPoint presentation on this item.

Discussion was held regarding the percentage of sustainable cases (20-25% of those entered); EEO cases vs. Non-EEO cases; breakdown of complaint types, which were sustained, to track trends and patterns (i.e. is sexual harassment growing, or is it minimal, or is it racial harassment).
Vice President Tolentino wanted to get a sense of whether we are progressing or not. When we
came on the Board there were various kinds of harassment (i.e. religious, sexual, race) and
hopefully that is being minimized now.

Chief Everett stated he believed their upcoming EEO training will assist, and that the new
Management Analyst position, which is currently going through the hiring process for approval,
will assist with the trend analysis.

Disciplinary Statute of Limitations
Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.

Mr. Paul Hayashida, Chief Special Investigator, Professional Standards Division, stated his
report was in response to the request by the Public Safety Committee to report back within 45
days of the February 3rd meeting, regarding the Department’s proposed actions for addressing
issues related to the statute of limitations for disciplinary action.

Mr. Hayashida summarized the report provided.

PUBLIC COMMENT: Mr. McOsker stated it may be a good idea to change the City Charter
regarding the statute of limitations and other aspects of our discipline, but he does not know
because they have not met and conferred and talked about it. He is committed to a well
disciplined Fire Department. He commented on representation, which police officers receive
and is paid for by the Police Department. At the Fire Department, we cannot even get a
detailed on-duty member when bodies are available because that would mean closing a
resource for the investigation. At no cost, they cannot even get somebody detailed. Honestly,
this came up because an elected official had a knee-jerk reaction to something in the news.
The Chief's revelation was in the news and it was understood then that we do not have ability to
go back and discipline him for it. But this is something that will affect the rank-and-file.

President Hudley-Hayes asked if/when this report is moved forward isn’t there still time for there
to be conversations, changes, etc. Fire Chief Cummings stated it will have to go through
Council Committees, then to full Council and then they will have to decide if they are actually
going to put it on as a Charter amendment on the ballot for March of next year. The Personnel
Department will coordinate it and decide which ones, of a whole list, that they want to bring
forward.

Deputy City Attorney Jackson clarified for the record - once this body approves it [the report], it
does not come back to the Board of Fire Commissioners.

Commissioner Furillo stated she cannot support moving it forward because it would be an
endorsement and she does not have a clear picture as to whether this has been fully vetted with
those that need to have the input, especially around the issues of the tolling.

MOTION (Friedman/Tolentino): That the Board approve the report and recommendations.
ADOPTED: AYES – 3 (Hudley-Hayes, Tolentino, Friedman); NOES – 1 (Furillo)

6. NEW BUSINESS – CONSENT ITEMS

A. [BFC 12-006] – In-Kind Donation for Carpeting of Fire Station 71
Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.
ACTION: APPROVED.
B. [BFC 12-007] – In-Kind Donation for Training Room Chairs  
Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.  
ACTION: APPROVED.

Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.  
See Item 7.

Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.  
See Item 7.

E. [BFC 12-018] – In-Kind Donation for Tree Trimming at Fire Station 71  
Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.  
ACTION: APPROVED.

F. [BFC 12-019] – In-Kind Donation for LAFD of Used Office Furniture  
Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.  
ACTION: APPROVED.

Recommendation: Receive and file.  
ACTION: RECEIVED AND FILED.

H. [BFC 12-023] – In-Kind Donation for Costco Gift Cards (Grateful Hearts Fundraiser)  
Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.  
ACTION: APPROVED.

I. [BFC 12-024] – In-Kind Donation for LAFD of Iced Tea  
Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.  
ACTION: APPROVED.

J. [BFC 12-025] – In-Kind Donation for Conference Table  
Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.  
ACTION: APPROVED.

K. [BFC 12-026] – Renewal of the Affiliation Agreement with the Regents of the University of California  
Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.  
ACTION: APPROVED.

L. [BFC 12-027] – Approval of the Draft First Amendment to the Vocational Education Training Agreement Between the City of Los Angeles Through its Fire Department and the Los Angeles Community College District on Behalf of East Los Angeles College  
Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.  
ACTION: APPROVED.

Recommendation: Receive and file.  
ACTION: RECEIVED AND FILED.
N.  [BFC 12-029] – In-Kind Donation for EZ-Glide Stair Chairs
Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.  
See Item 7.

O.  [BFC 12-030] – In-Kind Donation for Television for Training Room
Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.  
ACTION: APPROVED.

P.  [BFC 12-031] – In-Kind Donation for Celebrating Excellence 2012 Conference
Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.  
ACTION: APPROVED.

Q.  [BFC 12-032] – Request for Proposal – Aerial Firefighting Services
Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.  
ACTION: APPROVED.

R.  [BFC 12-036] - Corrective Action Summary – Notice of Discharge, Suspension, or Probationary Termination reports filed with the Board of Fire Commissioners – December 24, 2011 through February 16, 2012.  
Recommendation: Receive and file.  
ACTION: RECEIVED AND FILED.

S.  [BFC 12-038] – Approval of Staff Recommendations to Authorize the Fire Chief to Execute an Agreement between the LAFD and UC Regents to Provide an Air-Medical Clinical Care Coordinator in Accordance with Measure “B” Funding
Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.  
ACTION: APPROVED.

7.  ITEMS CALLED SPECIAL

6.N.  [BFC 12-029] – In-Kind Donation for EZ-Glide Stair Chairs
Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.  
ACTION: APPROVED.

Vice President Tolentino stated although Commissioner Bontá is not here, her impact remains; these EZ-Glide Stair Chairs go to the core work of what the Department does. He will be approving it, but we should not be supplanting the kind of things that ought to be provided to the firefighters; if needed, these items should be budgeted and obtained.

Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.  
ACTION: APPROVED.

Recommendation: That the Board approve the report and recommendations.  
ACTION: APPROVED.

Mr. Bill Jones, Contracts and Grants Management Section, Administrative Services Bureau, stated that Items 6.C. and 6.D., NCO Financial Systems, is an agreement that the Fire Department entered into. It was a piggyback off the Office of Finance that operates all the
collection efforts for the City of Los Angeles. When the Hi-Tech Act, under the HIPAA provisions from the Federal government, went into affect, the City of Los Angeles declared the Fire Department as a separate entity. Therefore, the Fire Department was required to enter into a separate agreement with NCO Collections and in the confusion we got behind; these two agreements bring us current.

MOTION (Furillo/Tolentino): That the Board approve the consent items.
ADOPTED: AYES – 4

8. REQUEST FOR FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS
   • Commissioner Hudley-Hayes requested a discussion of captains being included in a Board of Rights and also reorganization of the bargaining units. See Item 4.B.

9. IDENTIFICATION OF THE BOARD’S MEET AND CONFER NEGOTIATORS REGARDING DISCIPLINARY GUIDELINES
   Fire Chief Cummings identified Battalion Chief Charles Butler.

10. CLOSED SESSION
   A. Conference with negotiators pursuant to Government Code Section 54957.6(a) – To permit the Board to review its negotiating position and instruct its negotiators concerning the conduct of negotiations regarding disciplinary guidelines.

   The regular meeting recessed at 12:19 p.m. and the Board went into closed session.

   Deputy City Attorney Jackson called the regular meeting to order at 12:43 p.m. and stated no formal action was taken in closed session and no specific direction was given to the board’s negotiator at this time.

11. ADJOURNMENT

   The meeting adjourned at 12:45 p.m.

   ATTEST BY:

   _______________________________  _____________________________
   GENETHIA HUDLEY-HAYES  LETICIA GOMEZ
   President     Commission Executive Assistant II
   Date:   February 5, 2013

Note: Actions of the Board shall become final at the expiration of the next five meeting days of the City Council during which the Council has convened in regular session, unless the Council acts within that time by two-thirds vote to bring the action before it or to waive review of the action.